

**Lived Religion and the Changing Spirituality  
and Discourse of Christian Globalization:  
A Canadian Family's Odyssey**

MARGUERITE VAN DIE  
Queen's University

---

Few individuals have presented a greater challenge to a secular society's understanding of the past than the missionary. "Once almost universally acclaimed as a self-sacrificing benefactor, he or she is now more commonly dismissed as an interfering busybody and in all probability a misfit at home who could find only among the colonized a captive audience on whom to impose a narrow set of beliefs and moral taboos."<sup>1</sup> Thankfully, in the three decades since this memorable characterization by Canadian church historian John Webster Grant, research into related areas such as gender and theological change has done much to deconstruct these stereotypes. Recent work on Christian globalization has moreover drawn attention to the ways the missionary enterprise changed religion not simply among the indigenous population, but also at home. Mark Noll, for example, has argued that by the early twentieth century as part of a larger global "multi-centering," Christianity in North America was subtly shifting away from traditional church and imperial norms towards new models. It is now generally accepted that this re-centering was accompanied by an enormous release of evangelical energy, and the impact of an emerging global society profoundly reshaped Christianity.<sup>2</sup>

My essay builds on Noll's observations, but rather than focusing on missionary institutions and their spokespersons, it examines from below some of the continuities and changes in the spirituality and discourse of Christian globalization. It does this within the context of three generations

*Historical Papers 2015: Canadian Society of Church History*

of a well-to-do Toronto family for whom missions and international travel were a compelling way of life. The range of their interests was wide, and included Keswick spirituality and faith missions; mainline Presbyterian and United Church missions in China; medical work in India with the London-based Zenana Bible and Medical Mission (ZBMM); and, during the 1950s and 1960s, sustained involvement by the third generation in Moral Rearmament, founded by American Lutheran minister Frank Buchman. As this diversity indicates, one family's experience cannot be seen as representative. It can, however, provide some insight beyond that offered by institutional studies into the ways and reasons why spirituality and the discourse of Christian globalization could take on different forms over time even within a single family equipped with material means, strong spiritual examples, and a sense of moral responsibility.

The son of impoverished Irish immigrants, Robert J. Fleming, the family patriarch, served three terms in the 1890s as Toronto's youngest mayor, followed by seven years as assessment officer for the city. Admired for his public role on behalf of religious causes, he was a leader in temperance and prohibition causes and an active member of his local Methodist church, Toronto's Park Street Primitive Methodist Church, and, upon its founding in 1914, Timothy Eaton Memorial Methodist (after 1925 United) Church.<sup>3</sup> In 1904, to better support his large family, he became general manager of William Mackenzie's Toronto Railway Company. From that date, as a result of his judicious investments in real estate, stocks, and mining, the family's fortunes took a turn for the better. By the time of his premature death in 1925 he had ensured a solid financial future for his wife Lydia, their nine adult children, and, in time, a close-knit cohort of grandchildren.<sup>4</sup>

For a variety of reasons none of his four sons followed their father's example in active and public religious involvement. It was in the female branch where the religious interests and practices of the second generation flourished. This can be primarily attributed to Lydia Orford, whom Fleming, as a young widower with two young children, had married in 1888. Twenty-six years in age, and the only daughter of a comfortably situated Toronto family, Lydia entered the marriage with strong roots in the city's evangelical Anglican community. An organist at St. Peter's Anglican Church, she was also an active member of its Bible class led by lawyer Sam Blake, the ardent defendant of conservative evangelical causes. With other members of Blake's class, she spent many hours at his Sackville Mission in Toronto's East End where, as a young street corner

evangelist, she proclaimed “the gospel of Truth” to the city’s un-churched population. Her closest friend and co-worker at the Mission was Rosalind Bell-Smith, the daughter of renowned British portrait painter, John Bell-Smith, who had moved to Canada in 1866 to establish the Royal Academy of Art in Montreal. In 1890, leaving behind her affluent middle class life, Rosalind married Jonathan Goforth, the Sackville Street Mission’s unconventional and uncompromising young evangelist, and accompanied him immediately thereafter to the North Honan mission field of the Presbyterian Church in Canada.

### ***The Influence of Keswick Holiness***

Among the large crowd at the train station to see the Goforths off was the recently wed Lydia Fleming, who made a public promise to her friend that she would “hold the ropes” on the home front on her behalf. The result was far-reaching for both women. Rosalind’s regular letters to Lydia detailed an unwavering fundamentalist faith in the face of excruciating trials as a young wife and mother on an inhospitable mission field. Lydia, in return, through the intermediary of the Timothy Eaton store, sent her friend thoughtfully selected care packages and provided hospitality to two of the Goforth children when these were sent to Toronto to further their education.<sup>5</sup> Both the Goforths and Lydia were drawn to the conservative evangelicalism devoted to the promotion of holiness, presented since the 1870s at annual conferences in Keswick in the beautiful English Lake District. In 1910, Lydia, accompanied by her husband and Reba, their oldest daughter by his first marriage, attended a Keswick conference for the first time. To its followers, Keswick’s teaching on the spiritual freedom experienced through faith in the crucified Christ and the resulting infilling of the Holy Spirit was a strong motivator for foreign missionary work, making Keswick a major recruiter for independent faith missions, such as Hudson Taylor’s China Inland Mission.<sup>6</sup>

With its emphasis on prayer and non-denominationalism, Keswick spirituality found a natural partner in the growing number of British independent women’s missionary societies pursuing such separate “women’s work for women” as hospital care, education, evangelization, and, in India, zenana visiting. Among these was the ZBMM founded in 1852, and which, by 1900, had become an extensive global network that included branches in Ireland, Scotland, New Zealand, Australia, and Canada.<sup>7</sup> Essential for the financial support of such independent faith-

based societies were women on the home front who offered a carefully calibrated response that balanced fundraising and prayer. Here Keswick spirituality flourished as regional ZBMM prayer gatherings in England were mounted to coincide with Keswick's annual conferences.<sup>8</sup> In 1912, two years after her first visit to Keswick, Lydia took on the presidency of the Canadian auxiliary, which in 1903 had assumed oversight of the ZBMM's hospital in Nasik, located in west central India, about 200 kilometers north-east of Mumbai.<sup>9</sup> Practically minded, concerned about the cultural and spiritual plight of women in India, and intensely committed to prayer, she was the ideal person to ensure the vitality of the Canadian auxiliary. First at St. Clair Avenue West and, after 1923, at "Donlands," a 950 acre farm to the north of Toronto (now the intersection of Eglinton Avenue and Don Mills Road), her home became the elegant stage for drawing room meetings as upwards of sixty women met to raise funds and hear visiting missionaries. Among the major fundraising projects for the Canada hospital were a "babies bungalow" completed in 1927, and, ten years later, a residence for the staff composed largely of Indian nurses and nurses in training, supervised by Dorothy Holden, a Torontonian.

Thanks to the efforts of Thomas Cook's travel agency, the Keswick conferences, located in an attractive area for salutary holidays, became a major stimulus in the spread of organized evangelical tourism. Lydia's 1910 trip to Keswick became the first of many overseas trips combining family visits with the pursuit of religious causes, a pattern familiar among well to do evangelicals. Such travels were, as Mark Hutchinson and John Wolffe have observed, "congruent with the broader therapeutic society in which these middling classes lived and placed their hope."<sup>10</sup> For Lydia and her daughters this included regular times for spiritual and physical renewal at various American health centres, thereby further extending their network of evangelical contacts. Much of the more distant travel, however, was directed at visits to far-flung family members pursuing missionary work – in 1920, Lydia, accompanied by two daughters, visited Reba, spending three years as a self-funded missionary with the Goforths in China. The trip included extensive tourism in Korea and Japan and a hair-raising confrontation with bandits while touring down the Yangtze River.<sup>11</sup> A visit to India followed in 1927-28, with her two youngest daughters and a daughter-in-law, to dedicate the newly constructed baby bungalow at the Canada Hospital at Nasik and to lay the cornerstone of the proposed nurses' residence. Study tours in prominent religious venues were part of the new 'religious tourism' and, in 1931, she and Reba, en route to China

to meet with newly wedded daughter Stella on the Honan mission field, stopped in Palestine for a session organized by Charles Trumbull, editor of the respected weekly, *The Sunday School Times*. A strong proponent of Keswick, in 1923 Trumbull had established an American 'Keswick' in New Jersey.<sup>12</sup> Visitors had included Lydia and Reba Fleming, who, in 1930, were delighted to attend the first conference of a Canadian Keswick, located at Ferndale in Ontario's scenic Bruce Peninsula.

In 1936, again in the company of Reba, Lydia embarked on a second extensive trip to India, intending to spend some time with her second youngest daughter, Evelyn, since 1930 a surgeon at the Nasik hospital. Her heart was not strong and in September, while in Nasik, tended by her physician daughter and Reba, she died. Two months later her life was commemorated at an overflowing funeral service at their family church, Timothy Eaton Memorial. Presided over by a United Church theologian and an evangelical Anglican minister, the event brought together an ecumenical group of civic and religious leaders whose eulogies reflected her many and varied interests and causes. Praised as a missionary in her own right, Lydia over the years had had a significant association not only with the ZBMM, but also as a Bible class teacher in her United Church congregation where a special Fleming sewing circle was dedicated to making western clothing for children at the Nasik hospital. The list of her involvements was long: the Methodist and United Church Women's Missionary Society, the British and Foreign Bible Society (on whose women's auxiliary she had served a term as president), the Upper Canadian Tract Society, the Sudan Interior Mission, the Intervarsity Christian Fellowship, the Toronto Bible College, the Toronto Mission Union and its Sackville mission, and the Canadian Keswick Conference.<sup>13</sup> While Baptists such as Toronto's T.T. Shields were in step with the combative American fundamentalism of the 1930s, the city's Anglican evangelicals modeled a more moderate approach in an emerging conservative network. Here influential laywomen such as Lydia provided an important bridge. Doctrinal distinctions fell away when women engaged one another in practical mission work accompanied by prayer.

For women such prayers were a public extension of evangelical domestic religion. Eulogists at Lydia Fleming's memorial service extolled her maternal role at home as a model and as the wellspring of her strong commitment to mission work. In their home life, Lydia and Robert dedicated each newborn to "Almighty God, our Maker," and each day began with the entire household, children as well as servants, gathering on

their knees in worship while their father asked for God's mercy and protection.<sup>14</sup> To correct an earlier evangelical emphasis on sin, guilt, and shame, the more liberal approach to domestic religion in the early twentieth century focused on positive energy expressed through such means as hospitality and harmonious relationships.<sup>15</sup> Hospitality for the Flemings included taking into the family home, sometimes for extended periods, missionaries or their children, hosting educational and fund-raising missionary events, and providing money and material goods to local families in need. It was part of a longer tradition that went back to the time when the Flemings had immigrated to Canada during the Irish famine. At the centre of this tradition had been Fleming's older half-sister, Polly Verner, who, with her husband, turned her small home and store in Toronto's Cabbagetown district into a safe haven for the family's large number of orphaned and motherless children in the 1870s and 80s, as well as providing financial relief to down and out customers. (For a short time it also hosted a small holiness group, whose claims to divinely sanctioned meals and credit came to an abrupt end when, one day, Polly, claiming a counter revelation, cut off all further credit and thereafter dropped out of the group).<sup>16</sup> Stories of Polly's selfless generosity in hard times became a powerful source of collective identity in more affluent days, and family harmony and goodwill trumped any potentially divisive allegiances that sporadically surfaced in the voluminous correspondence among siblings. Robert Fleming's final words to his children, frequently recalled, had been the admonition to love one another. This would be reinforced twelve years later, when, in India, their dying and much loved mother implored the Almighty that each of her children be eternally saved.

### ***The Interwar Years: Indigenization and Internationalism***

It was up to the second generation, growing up in quite different circumstances from their elders, to translate this spiritual ideal of harmony and hospitality into their own context. Mission work continued to attract the daughters in ways that both fed on and differed from their mother's experience. Already intimated at the 1910 Edinburgh Conference of World Wide Missions, the approach to missions underwent marked changes during the interwar period. Moving beyond the well-studied liberal/conservative battles on missions, Dana Robert has drawn attention to the prominence of Christian indigenization and internationalism discourse among mainline denominations during this period.<sup>17</sup> In a recent study of

global evangelicalism, Mark Hutchinson and John Wolffe have seen earlier evidence of this in conservative evangelicalism and its Pentecostal offshoot, both rooted in Keswick spirituality and both providing “a unified, experiential worldview built around a personal sense of calling to ultimate ends.”<sup>18</sup> New religious groupings with an enthusiasm for global mission, such as the Christian and Missionary Alliance (CMA), further diversified the approaches westerners were taking towards indigenization on the mission field. Where earlier revivals had been transatlantic, those of the early twentieth century saw the rapid emergence of a global evangelical culture with such new “hot spots” as Melbourne (1902), Wales (1904), Mukti, India (1905), the Heart of Africa Mission in the Belgian Congo (1914), and Manchuria, where, in 1908, Jonathan Goforth began a period of mass revival linked by migrant Christian workers.<sup>19</sup> What had once been a fairly simple shared evangelical missionary discourse now became disparate. Each of the Fleming daughters, in different ways, entered into this conversation. Spiritually their voices differed, but the shared discourse of family identity allowed relationships to remain intact.

Daughter Rebecca, known as “Reba,” and deeply religious, had accompanied her stepmother on most of her travels and was drawn to the emerging Pentecostal movement. During the three years she spent with the Goforths in China, once the rudiments of mandarin were mastered, she helped at a missionary school for the blind in Shantung under a Chinese principal. Her letters home reveal a contradiction not uncommon among her peers on the mission field: an intense love for the souls of those considered heathen, accompanied by a dismissal of their “paper idols” and their different cultural habits, not least of which were an absence of soap, water, and modest clothing. The Chinese practice of foot binding also called for frequent critical comment. However, at a time of widespread famine and acute suffering among the Chinese in 1917, she was able to contribute \$1,000 towards relief thanks to a gift sent by her father.<sup>20</sup> Her career as an active missionary was short-lived, but for the remainder of her long life she maintained a lively interest in conservative expressions of world evangelization, especially in its more charismatic forms. By 1926 she was actively involved in Toronto with students at the CMA’s recently founded Canadian Bible Institute, inviting them to one of the farms her father had bought near Pickering, helping organize their mission placements in Canada, and enthusiastically sharing in letters with Agnes, her youngest and still religiously malleable sister, their joyful accounts of material deprivation.<sup>21</sup> The following year she briefly joined the staff of

the new Canadian Pentecostal Bible College in Winnipeg under its principal J.E. Purdie, an ordained Anglican priest.<sup>22</sup> There she came into contact with the World Evangelization Crusade (WEC). Founded as the Heart of Africa Mission in 1913 by Charles Studd, one of the famed “Cambridge Seven” missionaries to China, the WEC would become Reba’s primary interest and the recipient of a generous legacy at her death in 1962.<sup>23</sup> In Toronto she attended the ministry of Oswald Smith, first at the CMA’s Christie Tabernacle, and later, after his resignation from the Alliance, his independent People’s Church, both with a strong emphasis on foreign missions.<sup>24</sup> In 1942, having experienced a “new dedication to Christ” at a WEC conference in Pittsburgh, she ensured that the organization would also have a home in Toronto. Prompted by its premise as a faith mission that “giving must be under strict [divine] guidance,” she bought her own home, which she then shared as a WEC training and respite centre (thereby ingeniously overriding her late father’s legal efforts to protect his kind-hearted daughter from giving away her inheritance).<sup>25</sup> At the Centre she drew on her earlier training at the Lillian Massey School of Household Science to offer missionary trainees lessons in domestic science and deportment, helping them, often anonymously, with their financial needs for mission equipment and travel.<sup>26</sup>

Whereas Reba’s approach to world missions hearkened back to an earlier model of converting the heathen to western Christianity and culture, her four younger sisters were influenced by the new emphasis on Christian indigenization and sensitivity to the host culture. The two oldest, Stella and Victoria (usually called “Queenie”), deferred marriage until they met the ideal spouse, who in both cases turned out to be a significantly older, widowed missionary. Stella first met her future husband, Murdoch Mackenzie (1858-1938), during the trip in 1919-20 to Reba in China, but it would take another seven years and extensive travel in South America and Europe, before she accepted his proposal. The two were married in October 1927 in a simple ceremony at “Donlands.”<sup>27</sup>

In 1889 the Presbyterian Church had sent Mackenzie and his first wife as part of the second missionary contingent to North Honan where, for the next forty years, he evangelized and established churches until his retirement in 1937. Known for his sensitivity to Chinese culture and religions, he became a strong advocate of an indigenous self-supporting Chinese church and in 1913 published *Twenty-Five Years in Honan*, a thoughtful book-length description of the missionary encounter with the native population. His approach to Christian evangelization reflected the



new interest among liberal evangelicals in the historical Jesus and his teaching of the Kingdom of God. Using as a model the propagation of “the Jesus religion” during the apostolic period before its institutionalization, Mackenzie and his cohorts sought to present a pure form of Christianity, “neither Canadian nor Chinese,” distinct from its subsequent institutional history in western imperialism.<sup>28</sup> At the same time, drawing on Jesus’ role as a teacher and healer, they broadened the earlier approach to evangelization to include education and medical work. Historians such as William Hutchison have depicted the resulting strong investment in schools, hospitals, and churches by mainline denominations as “a moral imperative for imperialism.”<sup>29</sup> More recent revisionist work by Dana Robert has presented this investment in an indigenous infrastructure as a contributing factor to the re-centering of Christianity and to its ongoing vitality in the non-western world. However, while she locates the discourse of indigenization in the interwar period, the writings of Murdoch Mackenzie and others, such as his friend R.P. MacKay, the Foreign Missionary Secretary of the Canadian Presbyterian Church from 1892 to 1926, reveal its presence well before then.<sup>30</sup>

By 1929, when Stella accompanied her newly wedded husband to her new home, the North Honan mission field was well advanced in its devolution, a process that was hastened by denominational financial constraints resulting from the global economic depression.<sup>31</sup> At the same time, western influences remained. All the elegance of a middle class western life style is evident in photos of their home in the Changte mission compound, where the couple regularly provided hospitality to visiting church dignitaries and, in 1934, to family members Lydia, Evelyn, and Reba, with Reba staying on an additional year. Stella would later recall her years in China as the happiest of her life, but her letters home at the time hinted at some of the challenges she encountered, not least of which was the couple’s commitment to an indigenous, self-supporting church. Writing to her youngest sister, Agnes, in 1930, she observed, “foreigners now have to work under the Chinese, who tell them when & where they may go.” Admitting that this could be humiliating, she was still grateful that, in the process, missionaries were learning valuable lessons “regarding the advancement of God’s Kingdom.”<sup>32</sup> As Mackenzie’s health began to deteriorate, the two reluctantly decided to return home. In 1937, shortly after Lydia’s death, the couple settled into rooms at Donlands, where Mackenzie died the following year.

Her younger sister, Victoria, would also marry an older, widowed

missionary. Stella had received a B.A. in English from Toronto's Victoria College in 1916, but since their father had concluded that there was little evidence of practical benefit, he had decided to send the younger sister to a Bible school instead. Victoria did not find Bible school particularly fulfilling, and, in 1919, she was happy to accompany her mother and Stella to visit Reba in China. She stayed on an additional year, assiduously studying and practicing mandarin and gratefully concluding that her exposure to Chinese culture had been a valuable substitute for a university education. At a time when marriage was seen as a woman's destiny, Lydia kept a watchful eye out for a suitable husband for her daughters, and shortly after Stella had finally decided on marriage, she was pleased to encourage the attention directed at Victoria by Walter Turnbull. After briefly serving as a CMA missionary to India, he had become a well-traveled and admired foreign missions executive, and, at the time, was serving as the popular Dean of Men at the denomination's Nyack College in New York State. A prominent newcomer in the growing web of conservative evangelistic movements, the CMA had been founded by William Howland, Fleming's predecessor as mayor of Toronto, and a member of the conservative Anglican network in which Lydia had been active prior to her marriage.<sup>33</sup> Several encounters between Victoria and Walter, thoughtfully encouraged by Lydia, soon resulted in a marriage in 1930, which gave every indication of happiness. Sadly, less than a year after their marriage, and while Victoria was expecting their first child, Walter was killed in a tragic car accident.<sup>34</sup>

As secretary of the denomination's foreign department, he had made two extensive global journeys visiting and establishing CMA missions, the first to China, Japan, French Indo-China, India, and Palestine, and the second to Latin America. CMA observers credited the new denomination's rapid global expansion to his strong conviction that the primary task of every missionary was to establish a self-supporting indigenous church as quickly as possible and then move on. An immediate hit with the Fleming family, Turnbull expound his vision of a native self-supporting and self-propagating church in India and China to Reba, inspiring her to reflect how she also might do "more along missionary lines."<sup>35</sup>

Differences in missionary approaches by conservative and liberal denominations have loomed large in the secondary literature, but, as indicated by Reba's response to Turnbull, what mattered within a mission-minded family like the Flemings were spiritual commitment and practical effectiveness. In Toronto's evangelical missionary circles this was the

general view, one that allowed for easy movement between the mainline evangelical denominations and the emerging more conservative movements.<sup>36</sup> Such blurring of distinctions between liberal and conservative evangelicals facilitated continuity among the generations in their participation in a globalizing Christianity. Though only Lydia and Reba had been drawn to Keswick spirituality, the two youngest daughters, Evelyn and Agnes, adapted their example of tireless work and constant reliance on the power of prayer to their own changed circumstances.

As the youngest in a family of recent wealth, the two had escaped the financial constraints experienced by their older siblings, and their carefree and seemingly frivolous approach to life became a matter of some concern to their mother. Agnes, the youngest, commonly called “Babe,” who had undergone a steady dose of her oldest sister Reba’s evangelism as a schoolgirl and had dreamed of becoming a missionary, tossed that ideal to the wind when, in 1927, at age twenty-two she met and quickly became engaged to Eric Bentley, a handsome, charismatic Montrealer. The life of her four-year older sister, Evelyn, to whom she was very close, gave every indication of moving in a similar path. After graduating from the University of Toronto in medicine in 1926, Evelyn had gone to London, England, for further training. Undeterred by the glut of candidates also looking for internships, she had happily socialized, including being presented at the British Court. Proudly escorted after the ceremony by a young Albanian diplomat, she soon thereafter saw a promising romance shattered by his recall to his native country.<sup>37</sup> To temper both of her youngest daughters’ affairs of the heart with a more sober experience, their mother asked them, along with a daughter-in-law, to accompany her on an extended trip through India to see first hand the work of the ZBMM in Nasik. Sent off by some 200 well-wishers gathered at the Fleming home, Agnes remained unwavering during the Indian trip in her decision to marry. For Evelyn, however, who joined them in London, the experience became spiritually transformative. “We have all been learning many lessons lately,” she wrote from Darjeeling to Eric, Agnes’ fiancé, “but the one that seems most marvelous to me and that gives one absolute satisfaction and happiness is that when we substitute our weakness for His strength and our hearts are filled with His love – one cannot help but radiate that love toward *every* human being. In a country like this where there is so much that is unlovely, and to me unlovable and repulsive, one has seen how lacking they are in appropriating this great gift of God.”<sup>38</sup> Several months later, back at her work and studies, while on her way

through Hyde Park to the Dorchester Hotel, a favourite venue for high tea, she experienced a sudden glow of great light and warmth, and instantly knew that her future lay in India as a doctor.<sup>39</sup>

After pursuing courses in surgery at the University of Edinburgh, she joined the staff of the Canadian women's hospital in Nasik in 1930 and remained there until 1943.<sup>40</sup> On her visits home she gave presentations on her work and women's life in India to various Canadian branches of the ZBMM and regularly agreed to newspaper and radio interviews. It was here, rather than in her letters home, that she provided some brief insight into her attitude to the indigenization and internationalization of Christianity.

The ZBMM had never been reticent during its long history about the perceived benefits the British Empire brought to India. While the other ZBMM hospitals in India (the Kinnaird at Lucknow, the Duchess of Teck at Patna, and the Victoria at Benares) retained an earlier, more westernized tradition and had been designed primarily to meet the needs of the better-class Indian women, Nasik's work was directed at country women. From the start, the hospital had led the way in Indianization. Its ideal was to be an "Indian Christian Hospital – as Indian as possible, as Christian as possible and as Efficient as possible."<sup>41</sup> Each patient was allowed to have a friend stay with her, all patients could wear whatever made them feel comfortable, and nurses wore the sari of the countryside with their heads uncovered. As a surgeon and educator at a mission hospital in the 1930s and 1940s, Evelyn saw herself as part of a larger narrative in which Indians were gradually modernizing with the help of their colonial mentors. Speaking with pride of the Government's recognition and praise of the high standards of training at the Canada Hospital in Nasik, she commented, "a necessary part of our contribution to Indian independence is to train young Indian women as nurses, fitting them to go out and serve their own people."<sup>42</sup>

Like some of her generation, she no longer fit the stereotype of the missionary whose primary purpose was to save souls, the ideal that had motivated her mother's friend, Rosalind Goforth, and her older sister, Reba. Dr. Fleming "looked like a carefree young person on her way to a garden tea when we talked to her in the living room of 'Donlands,'" noted a 1932 *Toronto Star* article. Nevertheless, the interviewer emphasized, "She is serious of mind, with her work the most interesting and thrilling thing in life to her." In Evelyn's words, "I couldn't go to India – it is depressing and so far from home – unless I felt the real call of the work.

In giving those people the gospel, we are transforming their whole lives as well as healing their bodies. The Hindu man's treatment of women is so dreadful and Christianity is the thing which will lift them out of that horror and make life bearable for them."<sup>43</sup> Although she did not use Murdoch Mackenzie's discourse of the Kingdom of God, her words reflect a shared conviction that that Gospel became indigenized in part through eradicating such perceived injustices as lack of education, medicine, and gender inequality. Home on furlough in 1942 after an exciting journey as nurse on a troop ship, she observed in an interview on CFRB radio that, "With us they learn that in the sight of God there is neither Brahmin nor other caste nor outcaste, but all are equal, and they see for themselves that each one receives the same loving care according to their need."<sup>44</sup> She left Nasik in 1943 and became chief medical officer with a large British tea company in Assam, assuming responsibility for its seventeen hospitals and the medical needs of a labor force of 34,000 largely female tea pickers.<sup>45</sup> The tug of family proved too great to remain there long and, in late 1951, after returning briefly for a farewell visit to Nasik, she embarked on an entirely new chapter of the Fleming family's global outreach – Moral Rearmament.<sup>46</sup>

### ***Moral Rearmament and Christian Globalization***

The Fleming engagement with Moral Rearmament began in 1932 when first Helen Hyde, the estranged wife of Lloyd, the second oldest son, and, shortly thereafter, Agnes and Eric Bentley became ardent supporters of its predecessor, the Oxford Group, founded by Frank Buchman. A Lutheran minister in Pennsylvania, Buchman had experienced a profound sense of divine love and forgiveness while attending a conference at Keswick in 1908. This led to him to develop a non-denominational Christian spirituality directed at effecting personal transformation. Critical of traditional missionary movements after he toured China from 1917 to 1919 under the auspices of John R. Mott and the International YMCA, he proceeded in the early 1930s to translate this experience into a new form of missionary movement, known as the Oxford Group, aimed at bringing about personal and collective change through carefully staged gatherings in large hotels and private homes. Though intended at a time of economic depression to appeal to people of all ages and social classes, the movement found its most receptive audience among well-educated young men and women of comfortable means for whom house and hotel parties were a

familiar venue. Practical rather than theological, and with no ties to any religious denomination, Buchman focused on helping individuals by encouraging them to adopt a simple spiritual discipline. Meeting daily in a period of “quiet time” with a partner or small group, they were to open themselves to the guidance of the Holy Spirit, confess to one another any sins that they had committed, and ask forgiveness of those wronged. This personal regime was to be part of a commitment to practice four “absolute standards” of moral behaviour – absolute honesty, unselfishness, purity, and love.<sup>47</sup>

One of Buchman’s talents was his ability to adjust his evangelistic efforts to cultural change, a flexibility that allowed for frequent re-invention. In the late 1930s, as war loomed, he reconfigured the movement as Moral Rearmament (MRA) and extended its focus on individual change to a promise of national and even global renewal. Often viewed with suspicion because of his rather naïve efforts to avert war through dialogue with Hitler and the Nazi leadership, he recalibrated and reorganized his movement yet again during the war years. From Mackinac, an American centre on Lake Michigan purchased in 1940, he began to focus on healing the wounds of war by presenting MRA as “a new world philosophy capable of creating a new era of constructive relationships between men and nations.”<sup>48</sup>

In the postwar period the urgent need for political reconciliation and reconstruction, the prevalence of industrial conflict, the rapid inroads of communism, and the beginnings of decolonization provided an opportunity to test his ideas. In 1946, he made a second purchase, a large bankrupt hotel, at Caux-sur-Montreux, Switzerland, to serve as a European centre. Located in the mountains above Lake Geneva, it was intended as a centre for international reconciliation on a more personal and informal level than that pursued by national governments. As the Cold War intensified into a struggle between two stark alternatives, communism and democracy, he increasingly envisioned Caux as “a world ideological training center for democracy.” The 1950s and early 1960s saw it drawing 4000 participants a summer from eighty countries. Strategically located in a neutral country and near the hub of the international organizations in Geneva, the MRA centre at Caux brought together large numbers of carefully selected French and German civic leaders, as well as representatives of labour and management, the economic sectors seen to be most urgently in need of reconciliation and most vulnerable to the inroads of communism.<sup>49</sup> With the warm endorsement of General Douglas MacArthur, in 1950 a

contingent of seventy-six prominent Japanese was also invited to Caux. Upon witnessing first hand the reconciliation between French and Germans taking place there, they traveled home via Bonn, Paris, and the United States, crossing the latter in a well-publicized automobile cavalcade.<sup>50</sup> In the late 1950s and early 1960s, African and European nationals seeking to make a peaceful transition to post-colonialism, most notably in Tunisia, Morocco, Kenya, the Belgian Congo, and, in the 1970s, Rhodesia-Zimbabwe, were similarly drawn to MRA's work at Caux.<sup>51</sup>

This post-war phase of MRA has received very little attention, and the place of religion in conflict resolution, as opposed to instigating war, remains an under-documented story. At a time when people were looking for spiritual and moral values to replace the war and violence of the recent past, Buchman and MRA, as a third party independent of church and state, were in a unique position to influence the process of reconciliation. MRA's efforts at a parallel diplomacy were informal and therefore hard to document. There is general agreement, however, beyond its own membership, that in fostering personal relationships among French and German politicians, coal and steel industrialists and union leaders, the meetings at Caux helped prepare the ground for the Schuman Plan in 1950 that integrated the two countries' coal and steel industries and later led to the formation of the European Economic States Community.<sup>52</sup>

Largely ignoring these efforts at reconciliation, critics have depicted MRA as simply an ideological alternative to communism during these Cold War years. In a sympathetic, well-researched study, *The Spiritual Vision of Frank Buchman*, historian Philip Boobyer suggests that its work and ideals can better be understood as an influential movement of Christian revival aimed at offering a spiritual response to the emergence of a global society. What held it together were a few simple spiritual practices intended to be life changing, and a shared conviction that, through the help of the Holy Spirit, those whose lives had been changed could influence others and "remake the world." This was not the Holy Spirit of charismatic movements like Pentecostalism, but a Spirit working through personal story telling, carefully staged dialogue, and dramatic productions, and more in tune with the changing culture. Reliance on the Holy Spirit rather than on a full-orbed Christian theology and discourse also made it easier by the 1950s to drop explicit Christian terms and make room for adherents of all faiths and ethnicities.<sup>53</sup> Familiar in some ways and attractively simplified and forward-looking in others, MRA appealed

to young people socialized in Christian institutions but eager to find exciting new expressions for moral concern.

Actively recruited by Agnes and Eric Bentley to this post-war phase of MRA's reconfiguration were the Fleming nieces and nephews, seven of whom, during the late 1940s to mid 1960s period, served in MRA for extended periods of time: Bob and Lou Fleming (Lloyd's twin sons), Lydia Bentley (Agnes' daughter), Margaret Fleming (daughter of Goldwin, the oldest Fleming son), Betty and Everett Fleming (daughter and son of Russell, the third Fleming son), and Catharine Turnbull (Victoria's daughter). Each came to the movement for different personal reasons, but family dynamics played an important role. Most, but especially Lloyd's twin sons, Bob and Lou, who had left their father to come over with their mother from England in 1935, and Catharine, had spent much of their childhood at Donlands, the Fleming family's home. Interest in missions and global awareness were part of the air the grandchildren had breathed, whether through the letters and stories of Rosalind Goforth, their grandmother and aunts, or the family's large collection of photographs depicting traveling members in exotic places and poses.

For the cohort of the 1950s, unlike many of the idealists of the 1960s who gravitated to secular NGOs like CUSO and the Peace Corps, spiritual concerns remained a part of personal and professional identity in addressing international concerns.<sup>54</sup> Though MRA drew its volunteers from a range of social backgrounds, its spiritual optimism and structured approach appealed especially to educated young people of privileged background who, like the Fleming cousins, had lost interest in an older missionary way of service yet retained a strong sense of *noblesse oblige*. To historian Robert Ellwood, those who reached adulthood during the late 1940s and 1950s found themselves conflicted between a yearning for normalcy and a profound sense of dislocation. As a result, they were now propelled as individuals and as families into uncharted terrain.<sup>55</sup> Conservative revivalists such as Billy Graham and Charles Templeton met the spiritual search for identity by repackaging evangelical Christianity in ways designed to reflect the period's growing youth culture. MRA leaders distanced themselves from such revivalists. Instead, they offered young people opportunities for self-knowledge and identity formation, which, though consistent with their childhood socialization, also spoke hopefully of how personal efforts could influence positively a war torn world in need of healing.



Through correspondence, memoirs, and interviews, the seven Fleming cousins who served in MRA have provided thoughtful insight into how the personal and global were related during their time with the movement. As young adults each experienced the need to cut through the thickets of family tradition and expectations and seek their own identity, one that was distinct from that of the older generation, but also not cut off from the family bonding they had experienced growing up together. The first of the Fleming cousins to become involved with MRA had been seventeen-year old twins Bob and Lou Fleming in 1941, when their mother had sent them as part of their war effort to work at Camp Hatley, a farm in the Eastern Townships, owned by prominent MRA supporters Bernard and Alice Hayward (daughter of Hugh Graham, publisher of the *Montreal Gazette*).<sup>56</sup> An avid photographer already in his early teens, Bob's awareness of the power of the camera "to move people's hearts and spur their spirits," soon thereafter set him off on a thirty-year stretch as an MRA photographer. Under the mentoring of Arthur Strong, a British portrait and news photographer, since 1938 full time with MRA, he was able to make important contacts with some of the many media, arts, and Hollywood motion picture personalities drawn to the movement. Such networks with influential members became part of MRA's identity as it propagated its message of "life change" through theatrical productions and films. Reflecting the culture of the 1950s, these helped the movement transcend language and ethnic differences on its global trips. In 1948, impressed at the Mackinac conferences by MRA's approach to post-war reconciliation, Bob joined an MRA international task force of several hundred as they toured major cities in the Ruhr region in West Germany. Under the aegis of the British, American, and French Control Commissions, the group presented a musical stage show, "The Good Road," aimed at bringing reconciliation. Engaging in round-table discussions with business, labour, civic, and academic leaders, as well as large numbers of students, the volunteers gained first-hand impressions of the area's devastation caused by the war. Some of Bob's photographs of the encounters in the midst of ruined cities were later collected in a booklet, *The Road From Ruin*, with appropriate captions advertising MRA's ideals.

MRA's reconciliation efforts at Caux fired the idealism of other young Flemings. Catharine Turnbull, who first visited the centre with her mother in 1950, two years later, upon her graduation from Toronto's Victoria College, returned to join an MRA team of young people working in the German coal mining Ruhr region. Hearing first hand the stories of

both Allied and German civilian suffering during the war, she admired the ways former combatants were meeting one another in honest discussion.<sup>57</sup> From 1952 to 1953, Bob's twin brother, Lou, traveled as technical manager of theatrical productions with another group of 200 MRA workers to India, Pakistan, and Sri Lanka, in an effort aimed at "breaking down barriers between East and West."<sup>58</sup> In 1955, Bob, now as official staff photographer, accompanied a three-month "Statesmen's Mission" in which a group of 400 European MRA workers and former political leaders toured Asia, the Middle East, and Africa with a musical, "Vanishing Island," directed at a peaceful resolution of impending postcolonial hostilities and resisting communist takeover. Among the travelers was his aunt Evelyn who had been drawn to MRA's approach to forgiveness and reconciliation in India and, in 1952, became one of its two full-time physicians. The year after the "Statesmen's Mission," another cousin, Everett, spent time in Morocco as part of a small MRA contingent as the colony prepared for independence from France.

MRA work required total commitment that extended to marital relations and to limiting family size. All three male cousins married full-time volunteers and would spend a significant number of years with MRA. The father of Everett's bride, Frederica Bull, happened to be Canada's ambassador to Japan and the couple's wedding in 1962 at the Canadian Embassy in Tokyo became an international event. It happily coincided with the opening of a new MRA centre in Japan, the completion of Bull's diplomatic posting, and a visit by the Anglican Primate of Canada.<sup>59</sup>

Among those present at Everett's storybook wedding was his cousin, Margaret, recently arrived in Tokyo to teach at a girl's school. In 1954, in the course of a visit to Caux, she became the last of the Fleming cousins to become an enthusiastic MRA volunteer. Her carefully preserved letters, which retain an immediacy lacking in the much later reminiscences of her cousins, offer invaluable insight into the attraction MRA posed to a highly intelligent, introspective young woman. Her father Goldwin, the oldest of R.J. Fleming's surviving sons, like his father, was a man of strong views who held high expectations of his talented children.<sup>60</sup> These headed him into a collision course with his second oldest daughter, who had recently graduated as head girl of Toronto's University College. His categorical insistence that she break off her relationship with a Roman Catholic young man, along with her own growing sense of discomfort with what she considered a superficial life, led her to abandon a short career as a school teacher and accompany her older brother Ross to England. While he

pursued further medical studies, she embarked on a European tour. At Caux the presence of cousins Catharine, Lydia, and Bob, as well as Aunts Evelyn and Agnes and Uncle Eric Bentley, turned an intended brief stop into a family reunion. Her immediate family had been critical of MRA, and though she had had no intention of staying, Margaret fell under the spell of Caux and began to waver. What drew her most, as she explained to her startled parents, was the clear sense of purpose and honesty of the MRA volunteers, something that was far removed from the evangelical spirituality that she and her cousins had come to dislike. "There is nothing sentimental or aunt Reba-ish about it," she informed her parents two weeks after arrival, "it is clean, hard fighting."<sup>61</sup> Speaking of the decade in which the Fleming cousins had reached adulthood, Swiss psychiatrist Paul Tournier (who was himself sympathetic to MRA) has noted the negative effects high parental standards placed on youth, giving them little space to strike out in new directions.<sup>62</sup> To Margaret, MRA offered volunteers a new and meaningful way of life. "Here at Caux I have really found how to get rid of the barriers I have built, and to face (without fear of being hurt) the real me inside," she confided to her brother. "And am I ever thankful for that! It has made me see clearly why things weren't going quite right, what to do about it, and where to go in the future. Because here at Caux, men and women from *everywhere* are demonstrating a practical, positive, outgoing, happy, and satisfying way of life that is really working miracles in human relations around the world. They are showing that democracy can be just as straightforward and just as powerful as the strongest communism – and they are out to convince the 'democratic' countries of that before they are swept up by the passion of communism."<sup>63</sup>

Initially working at the MRA British headquarters in London, she helped spread MRA teachings among university students through dramatic productions and personal conversations. At the same time, she daily practiced MRA's spiritual regime whose backbone consisted of waiting for spiritual guidance and seeking forgiveness and reconciliation with those wronged. Each of the Fleming cousins had experienced first hand its power as they confronted their own longstanding losses and hurts.<sup>64</sup> In Margaret's case, reconciliation happened in the course of her father's visit to London in April 1956, four years before his unexpected death.

Time was spent briefly thereafter with the MRA mission in Morocco, in which her cousin Everett was actively engaged. This was followed by more sustained periods of work at an MRA centre in Kisco,

New York, and in various Canadian cities and towns. The summer of 1962 found her in Mackinac Island preparing for a posting at a girls' school in Tokyo, where she arrived in time to attend her cousin's wedding. Two years later, she eagerly prepared to accompany a prominent Japanese family and MRA supporter, the Shibusawas, to London to stay with the family of Peter Howard, who, following Buchman's death in 1961, headed MRA.<sup>65</sup> Tragically, she was unable to make the journey, for a minor injury left untreated too long resulted in pulmonary embolism and her death on 5 October 1964 at age 35.

Despite the reconciliation with her father, her immediate family had retained their misgivings about her decision to join MRA and was devastated by her death.<sup>66</sup> The event was part of a larger unraveling of the Fleming family's involvement in MRA. MRA's sense of mission had begun to wane in the early 1960s when first, in 1961, Buchman and then suddenly, in February 1965, his successor, Peter Howard, had died.<sup>67</sup> In these latter years ambivalence and in some cases disillusionment concerning MRA's structure and approach had surfaced among most of the Fleming volunteers.<sup>68</sup> Much introspection would follow.

As they moved into new opportunities for service, the practical experience, contacts, and, in most cases, the self-confidence they had acquired during their lengthy years of service were not, however, wasted. New careers opened that seemed far removed from their former identity as MRA volunteers: nursing for Betty, finance for Everett, theatre management for Lou, and for Bob photo-journalism with *Pace* (an innovative news magazine, centred in Los Angeles, initiated by several former MRA members). Catharine, his cousin, joined him at *Pace* as a researcher, uncovering global stories of human interest.<sup>69</sup> Later, she and her husband, broadcaster and former Jesuit priest Neil McKenty, would actively involve themselves in a Christian Meditation Centre in Montreal, founded in 1978 by Father John Main, a Benedictine monk. Influenced by an Indian teacher, Swami Satyanada, whom he had met while in Malaya in 1955, Main became a key figure in introducing eastern meditation practices to North Americans who, like the McKentys, were searching for contemplative forms of spirituality.<sup>70</sup> In so doing, he and they were participating, perhaps unwittingly, in the larger re-centering of a global Christianity as it decisively shifted away from traditional church and imperial norms towards more individualistic spiritual practices.<sup>71</sup> Over a century these practices and their discourse became endlessly varied. In three generations of a single family, the resulting new spiritual identities

included Primitive Methodism, evangelical Anglicanism, Keswick, Pentecostalism, indigenous Chinese and Indian forms of Christianity, post-war Moral Rearmament, and the adaptation of ancient forms of eastern meditation.

### **Conclusion**

As is evident in this brief overview of the lived religion of one family, a departure from the well-trodden road of theological and church history can lead to unexpected and unpredictable paths. The influence of Keswick spirituality in motivating women such as Lydia and Reba Fleming and the supporters and workers of the ZBMM is not part of the more familiar American and Canadian narratives of liberalizing evangelical missions as told, for example, by William Hutchison in *Errand to the World* and Robert Wright in *World Mission*. And while John Wolffe and Mark Hutchinson underscore the role of Keswick in their history of global evangelicalism, they fail to address the efforts at indigenization by mainline missionaries such as Murdoch Mackenzie, and give only a nod to the “world-life changing” ideology of post-war MRA.<sup>72</sup>

Lived religion, on the other hand, moves a familiar narrative into uncharted terrain and makes connections where none seem to exist. In the case of the Fleming family, the connecting factors include a shared religious socialization, a conviction that privilege and wealth entailed moral responsibility in a changing global society, and the financial freedom to put belief into practice for as short or as long as one wished. The spirituality and missionary interests of the first two generations may, at first glance, seem quite out of step with the third generation’s attraction to MRA’s personalist approach to global change. However, like the missionary movement, MRA assumed that bringing about global religious and cultural change was a western responsibility. Both also saw change to be not the work of denominational churches or political action, but of the Holy Spirit working through personal and nondenominational efforts. In the collective memory of the Fleming family, a sense of *noblesse oblige* combined with stories of transcendent spiritual experiences formed a consistent thread that included the Methodist holiness of their great aunt Polly, the Keswick spirituality of grandmother Lydia and aunt Reba, the story of their aunt Evelyn’s decision to serve in India, as well as mystical experiences among the third generation.<sup>73</sup>

Such spiritual experiences had an expansive optimistic quality and,

in their shared idealism about the possibility of world change, both the missionary movement and MRA were expressions of millenarian hope.<sup>74</sup> In retrospect, for the Fleming family, as for many active in the wider enterprise of Christian globalization, these assumptions were also fraught with contradictions and ambiguity. In the encounter with a globalizing world, individual and family lives, as well as the message people sought to bring, would be re-centred and surprisingly changed.<sup>75</sup> Here such stereotypes as “the self-sacrificing benefactor,” and the “misfit interfering busybody,” with which this paper began, provide little insight. Even such labels as “liberal” and “conservative” offer a dualism contradictory to the fluidity of reality. Religious discourse and constructs are much more rich and complex. They are embedded in every day lived experience. To cite cultural historian Robert Orsi, they “are never innocent, nor are the effects of their presence singular . . . The sacred is always caught up and implicated in struggles on earth. They bear the marks of history.”<sup>76</sup>

### **Endnotes**

1. John W. Grant, *Moon of Wintertime: Missionaries and the Indians of Canada in Encounter Since 1535* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1984), 215.
2. Mark Noll, *The New Shape of World Christianity: How American Experience Reflects Global Faith* (Downer's Grove: Intervarsity, 2009), 30; and Dana L. Robert, *Christian Mission: How Christianity Became a World Religion* (n.p.: Wiley-Blackwell, 2009).
3. For his early life and role as mayor see Marguerite Van Die, “Protestants, the Liberal State and the Practice of Politics: Revisiting R.J. Fleming and the 1890s Toronto Streetcar Controversy,” *Canadian Historical Association Journal New Series*, 24 (2013): 89-129.
4. In 1929 Donlands Properties Ltd., comprising 950 acres, and valued at \$667,357.50 (“the largest [deed] ever recorded in the county registry office”) was transferred to Lydia Fleming. ““Donlands’ Transferred,” *Toronto Star*, 1 February 1929.
5. For the relationship and letters between Rosalind Goforth and Lydia Fleming see Lois Neely Roberts, *Through Deep Waters to Higher Ground: The Life Journey of Jonathan and Rosalind Goforth* (Private publication). Their correspondence is in Tyndale University Archives, Toronto.

6. For Keswick see Ian M. Randall, *Evangelical Experience: A Study in the Spirituality of English Evangelicalism, 1918-1939* (Carlisle: Paternoster 1999), 14-45. For its influence on missions see Mark Hutchison and John Wolffe, *A Short History of Global Evangelicalism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 128; and Alwyn Austin, *China's Millions: The China Inland Mission and Late Qing Society, 1832-1905* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2007), 9, 186-8.
7. J.C. Pollock, *Shadows Fall Apart: The Story of the ZBMM* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1958). Founded as the Indian Female Normal School and Instruction Society (IFNS), an Anglican missionary society within the Church Missionary Society, the ZBMM became non-denominational in the mid 1870s under the enthusiastic leadership of the Kinnairds, a Scottish Presbyterian banking family drawn to the interdenominational approach of American-style revivalism. It was directed by an all-female committee and the presidency of the Lady Kinnaird. Steven S. Maughan, *Mighty England Do Good: Culture, Faith, Empire, and World in the Foreign Missions of the Church of England* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2014), 215.
8. In 1910 Lydia had met the renowned ZBMM missionary "Granny Pollen," who, upon the death of her husband, E.C. Pollen, a British District Officer, had commenced work in Bulandshahr, below Musoori. Two years later Mrs. Pollen visited her in Toronto, and, in 1927, accompanied Lydia and her daughters on their tour to the Canada Hospital in Nasik. "A Red-Letter Day in Nasik," *The Zenana: the Monthly Journal of the Zenana Bible & Medical Mission* 35, no. 403 (February 1928): 23-5.
9. Pollock, *Shadows Fall Apart*, 126-41.
10. Wolffe and Hutchinson, *Global Evangelicalism*, 127.
11. Agnes Fleming Bentley, "Memoir." Typescript, 11, Fleming Family Archives (FFA).
12. George Marsden, *Fundamentalism and American Culture: the Shaping of Twentieth-Century Evangelicalism, 1876-1925* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1980), 96.
13. "In Memoriam: Lydia Orford Fleming," typescript, 14pp., FFA.
14. Agnes Fleming Bentley, "Memoir," typescript, 6, FFA.
15. Margaret Lamberts Bendroth, *Growing Up Protestant: Parents, Children and the Mainline Churches* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers, 2002), 61-80.

16. Catharine Fleming McKenty, *Polly of Bridgewater Farm: An Unknown Irish Story* (Toronto: Cabbagetown Press, 2009); and J.V. McAree, *Cabbagetown Store* (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1953), 29-42.
17. Dana L. Robert, "The First Globalization: the Internationalization of the Protestant Missionary Movement Between the World Wars," *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 26, no. 2 (2002): 50ff.
18. Wolffe and Hutchinson, *Global Evangelicalism*, 144.
19. Wolffe and Hutchinson, *Global Evangelicalism*, 149-50; for Goforth see Neeley Roberts, *Through Deep Waters*, 94-147.
20. The famine is briefly described in Alwyn Austin, *Saving China: Canadian Missionaries in the Middle Kingdom 1888-1959* (Toronto: Toronto University Press, 1986), 193-5. Less successful was her father's other effort: to ship an automobile to China to facilitate travel for his wife and daughters, Stella and Victoria, during their visit in 1920.
21. Reba Fleming to Agnes Fleming Bentley, 7 August 1926, FFA. Lindsay Reynolds, *Rebirth: The Redevelopment of the Christian and Missionary Alliance in Canada* (n.p. 1992), 335-6. It opened in 1924, with John Turnbull as principal, brother of Walter, who would marry her sister, Victoria, in 1930. Both brothers were former CMA missionaries to India. In 1929, the Institute was closed for financial reasons.
22. Bruce L. Guenther, "Pentecostal Theological Education: A Case Study of Western Bible College, 1925-50," in *Canadian Pentecostalism: Transition and Transformation*, ed. Michael Wilkinson (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2009), 100-122; and James D. Craig, "'Out and Out for the Lord': James Eustache Purdie, An Early Anglican Pentecostal" (M.A. thesis, University of St. Michael's College, 1995).
23. "Spinster Leaves Most of Estate to Church Work," *Globe and Mail*, 28 April 1963.
24. Kevin Kee, *Revivalists: Marketing the Gospel in Canada, 1884-1957* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2006), 53-95. Lindsay, *Rebirth*, 148-53 gives a brief summary of Smith's conflict with the Alliance, and his founding of the Peoples Church in September 1928.
25. Norman Grubb and Alfred Ruscoe, "In Loving Memory of 'Aunt Reba,'" *Worldwide* 23, no. 1 (January/February 1963): 13.
26. In 1908 she had received a B.A. from Victoria College, University of Toronto. University of Toronto. Register 1920. [http://archive.org/stream/register00univuoft/register00univuoft\\_djvu.txt](http://archive.org/stream/register00univuoft/register00univuoft_djvu.txt) accessed 12 May 2015.



27. The event was described in detail by Reba to her mother and two youngest sisters, who were in India at the time. Reba Fleming to Agnes Fleming Bentley, 13 November 1927, FFA.
28. Murdoch Mackenzie, *Twenty-Five Years in Honan* (Toronto: Board of Foreign Missions, Presbyterian Church in Canada [1913]), 167.
29. William R. Hutchison, *Errand to the World: American Protestant Thought and Foreign Missions* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987), 91-124.
30. Andrew Thompson, *The Life and Letters of the Rev. R.P. Mackay, D.D.* (Toronto: Ryerson Press 1932), 62-105. Brian Stanley, *The World Missionary Conference, Edinburgh 1910* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans 2009), 234-35 cites Mackenzie's response to the Conference's work on the relation of the Christian message to non-Christian religions as an example of a respectful approach to Chinese culture within a conservative theological framework.
31. Ruth Compton Brouwer, *Modern Women. Modernizing Men: The Changing Missions of Women in Asia and Africa* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2002), 11-35, 55.
32. Stella Fleming Mackenzie to Agnes Fleming Bentley, 12 February 1930, FFA.
33. Lindsay Reynolds, *Footprints: The Beginnings of the Christian and Missionary Alliance in Canada* (Toronto: CMA in Canada, 1982), 158, 172. For Howland, see 210-27.
34. Reynolds, *Footprints*, 173, 272. A.C. Stead, "Missionary and Missionary Statesman, *The Alliance Weekly*, 28 June 1930, 405-6, 415. The entire issue was devoted to his life and legacy.
35. Reba Fleming to Agnes Fleming, 20 June 1929, FFA.
36. Murdoch Mackenzie's friend and immediate superior, R.P. Mackay, the Presbyterian Secretary of Foreign Missions, for example, appeared to have no difficulty also sitting on the boards of the China Inland Mission and the Toronto Bible College. Robert Wright, *A World Mission: Canadian Protestantism and the Quest for a New International Order* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1991), 122.
37. Evelyn Fleming to Agnes Fleming Bentley, 23/23 May 1927 and 14 June 1927, FFA.
38. Evelyn Fleming to Eric Bentley, 15 February 1928, FFA.
39. Catharine Fleming McKenty, "The Grandmother Who Rode Elephants," 13 [autobiographical account in possession of the author].

40. The successor to the ZBMM, Interserve, mentions this date and notes that Evelyn, along with Toronto nurse Dorothy Holden, left as the result of an unknown disagreement. I thank Douglas Virgin for this reference. *A Book of Memories* (Scarborough: Interserve Canada 2003), 7.
41. Pollock, *Shadows Fall Apart*, 128.
42. "CFRB Radio Broadcast. Interviewer Miss Leslie Stowe. Tuesday 24 November 1942," typescript, FFA.
43. "Daughter of R.J. Fleming Home After Years in India," *Toronto Daily Star*, 28 June 1932.
44. "CFRB Radio Broadcast," FFA.
45. "Flies from far Assam for short Toronto visit," *Globe and Mail*, 15 October 1948.
46. Evelyn Fleming to Agnes Fleming Bentley, 18 November 1951, FFA.
47. For a succinct, balanced introduction see Daniel Sack, *Moral Re-Armament: The Re-invention of an American Religious Movement* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009).
48. Philip Boobyer, *The Spiritual Vision of Frank Buchman* (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2013), 132; Sack, *Moral Re-Armament*, 119-39.
49. Sack, *Moral Re-Armament*, 141-61.
50. Garth Lean, *Frank Buchman: A Life* (Glasgow: William Collins, 1985), 389-92.
51. Michael Henderson ed., *The Forgiveness Factor: Stories of Hope in a World of Conflict* (London: Grosvenor Books, 1996), 37-73, 208-63.
52. Edward Luttwak, "Franco-German Reconciliation: The Overlooked Role of the Moral Re-Armament Movement," in *Religion, the Missing Dimension of Statecraft*, ed. Douglas Johnston and Cynthia Sampson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994), 37-57.
53. Boobyer, *Spiritual Vision*, 83-105.
54. Ruth Compton Brouwer, *Canada's Global Villagers: CUSO in Development, 1961-86* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2013), 40-41.
55. Robert S. Ellwood, *The Fifties Spiritual Marketplace: American religion in a decade of conflict* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1997).

56. What follows is based on an autobiographical account, Robert J. Fleming, "Memories of Norman Keene," 1-54, typescript, Robert J. Fleming Papers, Queen's University Archives, Kingston.
57. Catharine Fleming McKenty, "The Grandmother Who Rode Elephants," 28-37.
58. Michael Henderson, *Ice in Every Carriage: An Extraordinary Asian Journey, 1952-53* (Caux: Caux Books, 2010).
59. Everett R. Fleming, *From Meadowbrook Farm* (Private Publication, 2012), 108-33.
60. Ross Fleming, "Goldie: A personal memoir of my father Goldwin Orford Fleming 1889 to 1960," 24-6, typescript 2012, FFA. Everett, a son by Fleming's first marriage, had died of respiratory illness in 1901.
61. Margaret Fleming to Goldwin Fleming and Jean Ross Fleming, 17 August 1954, Ross Fleming Papers.
62. Paul Tournier, *The Person Reborn* (New York: Harper and Row, 1966), 58-68.
63. Margaret Fleming to Ross Fleming, 14 August 1954, Ross Fleming Papers.
64. Based on interviews and private memoirs, I have briefly discussed these in an unpublished paper, "A new spirituality for a war-torn world: one Canadian family's investment in Moral Re-Armament."
65. Margaret Fleming to Jean Ross Fleming, 11 July [1964], Ross Fleming Papers.
66. Paul Campbell to Ross Fleming, 2 November 1964, Ross Fleming Papers.
67. Sacks, *Moral Re-Armament*, 163-94. Since 2001 MRA has been re-named Initiatives of Change. See Laurent Gagnon, *Beyond Borders: Initiatives of Change in Quebec* (Caux: Caux Books, 2006).
68. For a balanced assessment of the high demands Buchman placed on its volunteers, see Boobyer, *Spiritual Vision*, 56-82.
69. Some of Fleming's *Pace* photographs with accompanying articles have been republished. See, for example, "Starvation and death haunted people of 'the other Brazil,'" *Kingston Whig Standard*, 25 June 2004. Both cousins later returned to Canada to join the Ontario public service, Catharine as a speechwriter for Bill Davis and Bob as an administrator of the Ontario Legislature.

70. Neil McKenty, *In the Stillness Dancing: the Journey of John Main* (London: Darton, Longman and Todd, 1986).
71. Robert Wuthnow, *After Heaven: Spirituality in America Since the 1950s* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998), 168-98.
72. Wolffe and Hutchinson, *Global Evangelicalism*, 165.
73. Interview Betty Fleming Beaman, 19 December 2013; interview Robert J. Fleming, 13 December 2013; McKenty, "The Grandmother who Rode Elephants," 13, 21-2.
74. Boobyer, *Spiritual Vision*, 156.
75. See, for example, Ruth Compton Brouwer, "When Missions Became Development: Ironies of 'NGOization' in Mainstream Canadian Churches in the 1960s," *Canadian Historical Review* 91, no. 4 (December 2010): 661-93.
76. Robert Orsi, *Between Heaven and Earth: The Religious Worlds People Make and the Scholars Who Study Them* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004), 4.