

**John Webster Grant – John Moir
Graduate Student Essay Prize Winner 2018**

**Identity Negotiating in Cultural Accommodation and
Spiritual Practice: A Case Study of the Chinese
Diasporic and Sinophone Christians in Four Toronto-
based Ling Liang (Bread of Life) Churches¹**

SHENG-PING GUO
University of Toronto

Then the angel showed me a pure river of the water of life, bright as crystal, flowing from the throne of God and of the Lamb through the middle of the street of the city. On either side of the river is the tree of life with its twelve kinds of fruits, producing its fruit each month: and the leaves of the tree are for the healing of the nations (Revelation 22: 1-2).²

The Position of Chinese and Sinophone Christianity in Canada

After a period of growth and stability following the Second World War, Canadians began to shed their Christian identity in the late 1950s and early 1960s. In 2011, representing 67 percent of the whole population, Christians continued to dominate the religious composition of Canada. But that figure represented a significant decline from 1961 when 96 percent of Canadians identified themselves as practicing some form of Christianity.³ The new reality in Canada was far more diverse – and one that included 24 percent of the population identifying as having “No Religion Affilia-

Historical Papers: Canadian Society of Church History (2018)

tion.”⁴

In 2011, “visible minorities” were well represented among Canada’s Christians, those identifying as having no religious affiliation, as well as those practicing other world religions including Islam, Hinduism, Sikhism, and Buddhism.⁵ Indeed, as new immigrants continued to arrive in Canada from non-traditional (non-European countries) all over the world, it was hardly surprising to see religions other than Christianity grow as an overall percentage of the population. And yet not all immigrants from these countries bolstered the ranks of non-Christian religions. For example, the largest number of Chinese Canadians – comprising over 64 percent of all Chinese people living in Canada – identified themselves as practicing no form of organized religion. Canadians identified as “Independent Chinese Christians” – denoted “Christian n.o.s.” in the 2001 census and “Christian n.i.e.” in the 2011 census – increased dramatically as a percentage of the overall Canadian population from 5.7 percent in 2001 to 7.6 percent in 2011.⁶

What happened to the practice of Christianity among Chinese Canadians? Why has it evolved as it has? What did and does it mean to be a Chinese or Sinophone Canadian Christian today? This article investigates these questions in the context of an indigenous Chinese “sect” of Christianity known as “Ling Liang Tang,” or, in English, the “Spiritual Food Church” or the “Bread of Life Church.” Ling Liang Tang was first established in Shanghai 1942. From there it spread first to Hong Kong and Taipei and, after the Second World War, elsewhere around globe. The Bread of Life Christian Church is distinguished by the practice of what is known as the “Ling Liang Rule” – a rule based on the older “Matteo Ricci Rule” for bringing Confucian perspectives to bear on Western forms of Christianity. My preliminary exploration of the history and theology of the Ling Liang Tang or Bread of Life Christian Church yielded what I describe a “three-in-one identity” model – a model that marries Chinese and Sinophone culture to Christian beliefs in contexts that are distinctively local and that contribute to the overall the spread of Christianity in a post-colonial world.

This article begins by describing the historical development of the Ling Liang sect as an independent form of Chinese Christianity. It then elaborates on the history of the four Toronto-based Ling Liang churches. Finally, it explores the hybrid “three-in-one identity” of Toronto church members as they negotiated the tensions that existed between their cultural identities as Chinese Canadians and their spiritual practices and beliefs as

members of these Christian churches. The main research question driving this article is “what does it mean to be a ‘Sinophone Canadian Christian’”? The article argues that the “three-in-one” identity characteristic of global Sinophone Christianity in the Greater Toronto Area facilitated the coexistence of believers’ Sinophone (Chinese-speaking, Chinese, and Chinese descendent or Chinese influenced) identities, their Canadian identity, and their Christian identities all within local forms of Christianity marked by this “hybridity.” Members of these churches lent support to one another by respecting the core values of each of these constituent identities under the broad umbrella of Christianity and in the local expressions of faith evident in these particular churches. The successful forging of this hybridized identity – comprising cultural, religious, and ethno-linguistic elements – among Chinese Christians helped drive the expansion of these churches in Toronto by attracting to their communities first, second, and third generations of Chinese immigrants from Hong Kong, Taiwan, mainland China, Southeast Asia, Europe, Africa, and other parts of the world.

Brief History of the Ling Liang Church and Its Toronto Enterprise

As of 30 April 2018, “Ling Liang Tang” – the so-called “Ling Liang big family” – had 518 independent or branch churches in forty countries and regions numbering about 200,000 churchgoers who, though mostly made up of Chinese, Chinese diaspora, and Sinophone Christians, also included other ethnic peoples from around the world. These congregations are organized by the Ling Liang World-Wide Evangelistic Mission Association (hereafter LLWEMA) headquartered in Hong Kong and the Bread of Life Global Apostolic Network headquartered in Taipei.

The Hong Kong-based Ling Liang World-Wide Evangelistic Mission was founded by Rev. Timothy Dzaio (1908-73) in Shanghai in 1946 and moved to Hong Kong after the communists took power in mainland China in 1949. The LLWEMA consisted of forty-seven Ling Liang (Bread of Life) churches among Chinese, Chinese diaspora, and Sinophone peoples in local communities in Hong Kong, Indonesia, India, Philippines, Australia, the United States of America, and Canada.⁷

The Bread of Life (BOL) Christian Church in Taipei numbered a global network of 471 churches or Good News Centers – including 185 in Taiwan, 105 in other areas of Asia, sixty-three in North America, seventy-six in Africa, twenty-three in Oceania, and nineteen in Europe.⁸ The BOL

Church, under the leadership of Rev. Nathaniel Chow (1941-), had a foothold in some forty countries around the world. As the Church spread, it transformed the fundamental expression of Chinese Christian culture among many global communities made up of Chinese, Chinese diaspora, Sinophone, and other believers.

In the late 1930s and early 1940s, under the shadow of the Japanese invasion of China during the Second World War, dozens of independent and indigenous (and frequently Pentecostal) preachers appeared as major purveyors of “a redemptive eschatology” in Shanghai, drawing freely on “premillennial dispensational teachings” to attract followers.⁹ Among them one of the best known was Rev. Timothy Dzao, the founder of the Spiritual Food Church and the church-based mission, the Ling Liang World-Wide Evangelistic Mission.

Timothy Dzao was born in Shanghai 1908. His father was a businessman and his mother a Buddhist housewife.¹⁰ He was the thirty-third-generation grandson of Zhao Kuangyin, the founder and first emperor of the Song dynasty in China.¹¹ In 1921, at the age of thirteen, his cousin Xie Bingyan brought him to Sunday school.¹² On Christmas Day 1924 he was baptized at the Mo Er Church.¹³ During a revival meeting at the Xin Tian An Church in 1925 led by Paget Wilkes (1871-1934), an English evangelical Christian missionary to Asia, and translated by Pastor Wang Zai (1898-1975), he dedicated his life to full-time ministry.¹⁴ Feeling that he was now born again in the Holy Spirit, and determined to be a light in the world, he changed his name to Shiguang (meaning “the light of the world”).¹⁵ He then entered a Bible college established by the Christian and Mission Alliance Society and studied there for several years. In 1928, Dzao was invited by the Shanghai Shou Zhen Church of the Christian and Mission Alliance Society to become a pastor. He was not finally and formally ordained, however, until 1932.¹⁶

While pastoring Shanghai Shou Zhen Church from 1928 to 1936, Dzao heard the Macedonian call.¹⁷ He shared his vision with Rev. Robert Alexander Jaffray (1873-1945), a Canadian missionary sent to China, Vietnam, and Indonesia by the Christian and Missionary Alliance.¹⁸ With the help of Jaffray, from September 1936 to July 1941, Dzao was sent by his church to serve as a missionary among several Chinese diasporic communities in the Nanyang region – including Malaya, Indonesia (especially Borneo Island), and Thailand.¹⁹ In 1941, he received an invitation letter from a church in Jakarta, Indonesia. When he was still planning his trip, however, the Pacific War broke out on 7 December, and

he was forced to suspend his plans. In March 1942, with the assistance of Gu Xianmin, a new graduate from the University of Shanghai, Dzao published the first issue of the *Ling Liang Monthly* in the name of the Nanyang Mission of the Shanghai Committee.²⁰ Pursuing the vision of a self-supporting, self-evangelizing, and self-governing Chinese church, Dzao found himself in prayer in the Huangjiasha Garden the following June. There he received a clear vision from the Holy Spirit to establish the Ling Liang Tang (Spiritual Food Church) together with his fellow believers Ms. Hua Huizhong, Ms. Wang Chunyi, Ms. Shi Huade, Mr. Gu Shouyi, and Mr. Wei Bole.²¹ In the middle of August 1942, the Ling Liang Church began holding worship services in the rented auditorium of the Xiejin Middle School.²² Within a few years, the Ling Liang Church had erected its own buildings, established branch churches throughout the city, and attracted more than 3,000 followers.²³ After 1942, Zhao's itinerant preaching led to the founding of several additional churches including two in Shanghai, one in Nanjing, one in Hangzhou, and one in Suzhou. By the late 1940s, the Ling Liang Church began developing its own network of educational and social services, including seminaries, middle schools, elementary schools, orphanages, and nursing homes. Dzao promoted these services, together with his own eschatological teaching, in pamphlets such as *Teaching Materials on the Book of Revelation* and *The Seven Dispensations*.

After the communists took power in mainland China, Rev. Dzao and his family fled to Hong Kong – still under British control – on 1 October 1949. On 1 January 1950, Dzao began renting the King's Theater in Hong Kong as a place to hold worship services. In September 1951, the Kowloon Ling Liang Church was established. It was here that Dzao conducted an evangelistic campaign over 100 days. Many refugees from mainland China came to hear his message of the gospel and accepted Christ. As a result, the Hong Kong Ling Liang Church was founded in May 1958. In addition, members of the Ling Liang Church who had fled mainland China also established the Bread of Life Christian Church in Taipei in September 1954. That Church also invited Dzao to hold several evangelistic meetings.

Rev. Timothy Dzao had a special desire to “go into all the world and proclaim the good news to the whole creation” (Mark 16:15). He shared this vision and stressed that this was the responsibility of indigenous Chinese churches. Accordingly, in June 1946, at a meeting of all Ling Liang churches, the decision was made to form the Ling Liang World

Wide Evangelistic Mission²⁴ – the first organization of its kind in modern China. Its mission was to preach the gospel to Chinese peoples in all parts of China as well as overseas to Chinese and Sinophone peoples of all backgrounds and nations. Later, two seminaries, the Ling Liang Seminary in Shanghai, and the East China Seminary in Suzhou, were founded to train missionary workers.²⁵ In December 1948, the Mission sent Rev. and Mrs. David Lamb to Calcutta, India, to undertake pioneering evangelistic work among Chinese Hakka immigrants.²⁶ The missionary couple established the Ling Liang Chinese Church Trust in Calcutta in 1961. This led to the later formation of two churches, the Grace Ling Liang Church and the Ling Liang Chinese Church, as well as and two schools, the Grace Ling Liang English School and the Ling Liang High School. In 1949, the Mission sent Mrs. Moses C. Chow to the Ling Liang Church in Jakarta, Indonesia, to serve as its pastor. She later served as the first pastor of the Chinese Christian Church in Washington, DC, from 1962 to 1968,²⁷ and as one of the founders of the Ambassadors for Christ, Inc. in Paradise, Pennsylvania. The latter organization was established for the express purpose of “reaching Chinese intellectuals for Christ in this generation.”²⁸

The Ling Laing Church is regarded as having earned “an indisputable place among notable indigenous Protestant groups of twentieth-century China”²⁹ for both its indigenous work its global expansion. As of 30 April 2018, some 518 Ling Liang churches had been established in those regions and countries where Chinese and Sinophone peoples had settled including Hong Kong, Taiwan, Macao, Indonesia (where the denomination is known as Gereja Santapan Rohani), India, Malaysia, Singapore, Thailand, Philippines, Australia, Mongolia, Japan, Africa, Europe, the United States, and Canada. All these churches participate in Dzaio’s vision for a global Christian mission among Chinese and Sinophone peoples of all nations and cultures. Their proselytizing efforts are generally carried out through programs that rely on preaching, publishing, philanthropy, and education.

In the shadow of the political circumstances that attended the Chinese Civil War (1946-49), the Cold War (1945-80s), and the decolonization of the Global South, Hong Kong and Taiwan have often served as safe locations for indigenous forms of Chinese Christianity to spread across the world. This has been the case, for example, for the True Jesus Church, the Local Church, as well as the Ling Liang Church.³⁰ The four Toronto-based Ling Liang churches traces their roots to both the Ling Liang Church based in Hong Kong and the Bread of Life Christian Church

headquartered in Taipei.

The Ling Liang World-Wide Evangelistic Mission Association established its headquarters in Hong Kong in 1986 and its member churches hold bi-annual conferences chaired by the circle of one church leader (pastor, elder, or deacon) chosen from churches comprising three districts: Hong Kong (with twenty churches), Indonesia (with fifteen churches), and North America (with six churches). As of 30 April 2018, among the forty-seven Ling Liang Church communities worldwide,³¹ six are located in North America: Torrance Bread of Life Church (in Los Angeles), New York Ling Liang Church, Orange County Bread of Life Church (in California), Vancouver Ling Liang Church, Toronto Ling Liang Church, and the Grace Ling Liang Church in Toronto.

The Toronto Ling Liang Church began holding services in June 1975 when Ms. Gloria Tien-Hwa Dzao, the fifth daughter of Rev. Timothy Dzao, and Ms. Tang Ling-An rented space on Floyd Avenue in downtown Toronto.³² After graduating from an American university, Ms. Dzao moved to Toronto to organize members of the Chinese Ling Liang churches who had already immigrated to the city and had established their own Ling Liang cell groups as early as January 1973. By November 1998, the church had erected its own building on Clayton Drive in Markham – a suburb of Toronto. Ms. Gloria Dzao remained a member and a deaconess of the Chinese congregation as of 30 April 2018.³³ On a sunny afternoon of April 2018, when I visited this church, I also visited the Timothy Manse – named to memorialize the founder of the Ling Liang Church.

The Grace Ling Liang Church in Toronto was founded in 1998 by Chinese and Sinophone believers who arrived in Canada from Hong Kong as well as India. These immigrants spoke both English and Hakka, a dialect of Chinese language. The congregation traced its origins to nine original families with Ling Liang ties who emigrated from Hong Kong in the 1980s and 1990s and who met together for informal worship services.³⁴ As they prayed together in the spring 1998, “the Spirit of the Lord led them to form a church. By faith they obeyed, and the worship services have been providing since the first Sunday of September 1998 without a break.”³⁵ As of 30 April 2018, worship services were being held in the Alumni Hall of the Tyndale University College and Seminary in Toronto while the church’s office is located in Markham. Senior Pastor Ting Tao Chiu was a former associate pastor of the Grace Ling Liang Church and the Ling Liang Chinese Church in Calcutta, India. He was instrumental in bringing about a merger of two the Grace Ling Liang Church and the Ling

Liang Chinese Church in Toronto in January 2002.

The Bread of Life Christian Church in Taipei sponsors a global network known as the Bread of Life Global Apostolic Network (hereafter BGAN). At the end of April 2018, it included some 471 churches.³⁶ Working under the leadership of Rev. Nathaniel Chow, Rev. Yongliang Ou, Rev. Tong Liu, and Rev. Ennian Zhang, the network reaches congregations in forty countries or regions.³⁷ The Taipei-based Bread of Life Christian Church established its BGAN – BOL (hereafter Bread of Life) Global Apostolic Network in 2009 and has two independent churches in Toronto: the Toronto River of Life Christian Church and the Fountain of Life Christian Church. The Fountain of Life Christian Church was founded by Senior Pastor Jason Liu in the Highland Junior High School in North York as an offshoot of the Bread of Life Christian Church in Taipei.³⁸

The Toronto River of Life Christian Church was founded in June 2013 as a daughter church of the Silicon Valley River of Life Christian Church by Pastor Richard Yeh.³⁹ It is located in Mississauga near Toronto.⁴⁰ As a granddaughter church of the Bread of Life Christian Church in Taipei, its short history was taken as evidence of a divine purpose for the Greater Toronto Area.⁴¹ The church traced its beginnings to meetings that first began in November 2010 and that, within a few months, had grown to include five regional cell groups and one Cantonese-speaking group. A part of their mission was to plant new churches in cities with universities. With that in mind, Pastor Mr. Jack Chen and his wife were sent to London, Ontario, and Pastor Victoria Lien to Waterloo, Ontario, in February 2013. The London River of Life Christian Church of Canada was founded in June 2015 under the eye of Rev. Tong Liu, Senior Pastor of the River of Life Christian Church in Silicon Valley.⁴² The Waterloo River of Life Christian Church was also established in June 2015.⁴³

Hybrid Three-in-one Identity of the Toronto Ling Liang Christians Negotiating in Cultural Accommodation and Spiritual Practice

According to 2007 data published by the British statistician David Barrett on global Christianity, Christians account for 33.2 percent of the world's population. Those practicing no religion account for 28 percent of the global population, or approximately 1.8 billion people. The latter figure represents a slight increase of 0.3 percent over 2006.⁴⁴ While the

number of people practicing Christianity in the West appears to be on the decline, a reverse trend is evident among Chinese and Sinophone peoples. According to several research projects – the *Chinese Protestant Mission Road*, authored by the Chinese Evangelical Privileges; the *Global Chinese Church Status Report 1998-2003* completed in 2007 by the Chinese Coordination Centre of World Evangelism (hereafter CCCOWE); and the recent writings of Chinese church historian Rev. Edwin Su (Pastor of the Shenzhen Training Materials Centre) – there are at least 9,000 active Chinese or Sinophone churches in the world. Among these 9,000 churches, 3,000 are located in Taiwan, approximately 1,200 in Hong Kong, 1,200 in the United States, 1,000 in Malaysia, 400 in Singapore, 350 in Canada, 350 in Indonesia, and 180 in Australia.⁴⁵ In addition, there were also about 100 Chinese theological seminaries and 500 Chinese Christian institutions active in these regions in 2007.⁴⁶ As many as 1,000 of these churches actively participated in the Chinese evangelical missions aimed at converting Chinese and Sinophone peoples in a variety of national, ethnic, and cultural settings.⁴⁷

Although these figures are large, the majority of these churches are, at best, small and medium-sized. Only a small handful would meet the thresholds necessary to be described as mega-churches. In Hong Kong, for example, about 95 percent of these active churches count fewer than 500 regular churchgoers while 70 percent number fewer than 200 people on an average Sunday.⁴⁸ In the United States, the average number of attendees at a typical service fell from 191 in 1998 to 149 in 2003.⁴⁹ If churches are defined by the number of registered churchgoers – with those counting fewer than 199 as small, 200-499 as medium-sized, 500-1,999 as large, and churches with more than 2,000 regular worshippers as mega-churches⁵⁰ – 90 percent of the Chinese, overseas Chinese, and diasporic and Sinophone churches would be considered small and medium-sized churches.⁵¹

The four Toronto-based Ling Liang churches all fall within this typical range attracting fewer than 500 regular Sunday worshippers.⁵² In the rest of this article, I argue that the Sinophone-Canadian Christians in the Toronto-based Ling Liang churches have developed particular strategies for affirming the tripartite identities of their members and adherents as Sinophone Chinese people, Canadian citizens, and Christian believers. By recognizing the importance of this “three-in-one identity” in church life, the local Bread of Life Christian church has become a “converting zone” that affords its members “an identity negotiating process.” This in turn

allows believers to formulate meaningful answers to questions about personal – who am I? – and communal – what can I do in this context? – identity. This dynamic process serves as one possible resolution to the Western missionary’s dilemma by facilitating the emergence of an indigenous form of Chinese Christianity that readily accommodates the ongoing cultural importance of Chinese Confucian beliefs and practices.

Identity I: As Chinese, Chinese Diaspora, or Sinophone People for the Nostalgia of China Centre in a Postcolonial Metropolitan Area

“Sinophone Christianity” is an amended analytic category coined by me as an extension of the discourse around “Chinese” and “Chinese diaspora” Christianity – a subfield of Chinese studies focusing on Christianity and Chineseness, nationalism, and Chinese nostalgia. Narrowly, the analytic framework of “Sinophone Christianity” defines its field as embracing overseas Chinese and Chinese diasporic Christianities beyond China proper. Broadly, it takes as its subject all kinds of Christianities in all Chinese-speaking nations, regions, communities, and societies all over the world including “Greater China” (mainland China, Taiwan, Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, and Macau Special Administrative Region).

Pioneered by comparative literature scholar Shu-mei Shih in 2007, the heteroglossia of the Sinophone is defined as “a network of places of cultural production outside of China and on the margins of China and Chineseness, where a historical process of heterogenizing and localizing of continental Chinese culture has been taking place for several centuries.”⁵³ In a 2011 essay, “The Concept of the Sinophone,” Shih conceived her conception of Sinophone studies,

as the study of Sinitic-language cultures on the margins of geopolitical nation-states and their hegemonic productions – locates its objects of attention at the conjuncture of China’s internal colonialism and Sinophone communities everywhere immigrants from China have settled. Sinophone studies disrupts the chain of equivalence established, since the rise of nation-states, among language, culture, ethnicity, and nationality and explores the protean, kaleidoscopic, creative, and overlapping margins of China and Chineseness, America and Americanness, Malaysia and Malaysianess, Taiwan and Taiwan-ness, and so on, by a consideration of specific, local Sinophone texts, cultures, and practices produced in and from these margins.⁵⁴

In short, building on concepts such as “cultural China,”⁵⁵ “Chinese-ness in practice,”⁵⁶ and Chinese “marginality,”⁵⁷ Shih’s concept of Sinophone studies offers a programmatic view of the parameters of post-colonial studies in Sinophone communities and cultures bearing a historically contested and politically embedded relationship to China – much like the relationships between the wider Francophone world and France – and through the historical processes of “continental colonialism” in Mongolia, Tibet, and Xinjiang, and “settler colonialism” in Nanyang.⁵⁸

The concept of the “Sinophone” in this article simply means “Chinese-speaking” in Toronto by Chinese, Chinese diaspora, and Sinophone peoples who existed along the margins of the cultures of the Chinese Han people and Chinese religions. At various times throughout history, many of these peoples fled China and Taiwan in order to avoid persecution for their religious or political beliefs. The Chinese language includes Putonghua (Mandarin) as well as Chinese dialects such as Cantonese (Taishanese was one of its variations), Minnanese (Taiwanese was one of the Minnanese or the Fukienese variations), and Hakka. Most share a common writing system of Chinese characters.

The Chinese and “Sinophone” Christians in Toronto are composed mostly of Chinese-speaking immigrants, or those whose ancestors settled in Toronto’s Chinatown sometime after 1878 when a Chinese immigrant named Sam Ching came to Toronto to open a laundry on Adelaide Street East. In addition, some “Sinophone” Christians are ethnic Chinese people or descendants of mixed parentage who do not speak Putonghua or any one of the Chinese dialects. Although these people may speak only English, Vietnamese, Malaysian, Tagalog, and/or other languages, they are culturally recognized as members of the Chinese community writ large and therefore are included in the target population of this study.

The Bread of Life churches in the Greater Toronto Area expanded steadily by defining Chinese or Sinophone identity with chief reference to the practice of the Ling Liang Rule. In Toronto churches the concept of the Christian’s “cultural accommodation” and “spiritual practice” include several dimensions. First is the use of the Sinophone languages (Mandarin, Cantonese, and Hakka) to preach, to pray, and to sing hymns written in Chinese characters. Second is the provision of affordances to members to make sacrifices to their ancestors using traditional Chinese rites tempered by Christianity. Such rites include, for example, the presentation of fresh flowers as a sacrifice in accordance with Confucian filial piety, as well as

the reading of a local announcement as a means for demonstrating Christian respect for one's Chinese ancestors. Third, after each Sunday service, Sinophone Christians eat Chinese food together (including Western-style Chinese food for children) at a Love Banquet of God. Fourth, members of these churches are also expected to celebrate both the high Christian festivals of Christmas and Easter, as well as traditional Chinese festivals, including the Chinese New Year, the Moon Festival, the Dragon Boat Festival, and others.

Identity II: As Canadian – Local Identity Negotiating for “Deep Equality”

Although Chinese-Canadians comprise one of the largest ethnic groups in the country, they have often been marginalized by mainstream Canadian society. Despite their importance to the Canadian economy, including their historical participation in the construction of the Canadian Pacific Railway, many white Canadians of European descent have expressed opposition to Chinese immigration. From 1885 to 1947, for example, Canada levied a prohibitively expensive head tax of \$50 to \$500 on immigrants from China. This sum amounted to the typical income a Chinese worker might expect to earn over a period of two years hard labour.⁵⁹ Worse still, this tax was the only such tax ever to be levied on immigrants entering Canada from a specific country. From 1923 to 1947, moreover, the Chinese Immigration Act prohibited any immigration to Canada from China altogether.

Christians belonging to the Toronto Ling Liang (Bread of Life) churches often pursued status as either permanent residents or Canadian citizens while nevertheless maintaining their traditional Confucian ethics and values. The church as community provided a practical means for those seeking to negotiate their identities in this way. For these “visible minority” people, the church became a significant aid in assuming a Canadian identity, learning English, and coming to understand the political and legal landscape of their new home.

For many, improving their English language skills was a high priority. Although this was not necessary in order to participate in the religious life of the Ling Liang churches, the church provided a convenient and ready avenue for this pursuit. Despite the fact that members almost always spoke one of the Chinese languages as their mother tongue at home, they faced serious barriers in finding work, pursuing study, and

interacting in daily life if they were unable to speak English. In response, the churches provided their members with free English classes, English Bible study cell groups, and included English sermons in their services.

Understanding Canadian customs and laws was almost as important as learning English. Many newcomers to Canada found it difficult to understand the way Canadians behaved, how Canadian society worked, and how the legal system and cultural traditions of this country influenced public behaviour. To help new immigrants acclimatize to these social and cultural norms, these churches provided a public space in which to ask questions, observe the behaviour of others, gather information, and to come to grips with democratic institutions and norms, political freedom, the criminal justice system, and so forth. This helped many to accelerate their adaptation to Canadian life by providing guidance and help in obtaining a drivers licence, pursuing further education, earning professional credentials, purchasing and owning a house, reporting taxes, participating in elections, and even taking a holiday.

Members of the Toronto Ling Liang churches were eager to negotiate linguistic barriers, familiarize themselves with Canadian cultural norms, and adopt common spiritual practices, in large part so that they could realize a sense of “deep equality” or “deep justice” – something far more significant to them than becoming mere objects of “tolerance” and “accommodation” premised on the abstract valuing of ethnic and religious diversity in a postcolonial metropolitan city.⁶⁰ Indeed, the concepts of “tolerance” or “accommodation” have been identified as particularly problematic in the discourse of white centralism – a discourse that describes such concepts as emblematic of a postcolonial hegemony premised on the superiority of the Western world relative to the culture of Sinophones. Lori G. Beaman, a professor in the Department of Classics and Religious Studies at the University of Ottawa and the Canada Research Chair in the Contextualization of Religion in a Diverse Canada, argues that the concepts of “toleration” and “accommodation” are, in fact, laden with an implicit inequality and are therefore an imperfect starting point for any dialogue about religious diversity.⁶¹ Rather than seeing equality as the ultimate outcome of any dialogue, Beaman contests that equality must serve as the initial starting point in order for a genuinely multicultural and inter-religious dialogue to begin. In a desire to achieve this “deep equality,” Christians attending the Ling Liang churches in Toronto wish to be seen as full residents, full citizens of Canada, with a recognized and accepted identity rooted in language, religion, legal

traditions, and cultural heritage.

Identity III: As Christian – Religious Identity Negotiating for Spiritual Needs in Mainstream Practice

Being members of a community that had been “double marginalized” from the China-centred Chinese as well as the white-centered Canadian, the Christians of the Ling Liang churches in Toronto could never fully identify themselves with either of these centers and therefore felt always on the periphery. Thus they pursued what was perceived to be a “major religion” in the Canadian context – Protestant Christianity – as a powerful means for fashioning a cosmopolitan identity rooted in both Canadian and Chinese cultural practices, English and Chinese languages, and Christian and Confucian spiritual norms.

By choosing to embrace Christianity – a “major religion”⁶² of the West – in order to achieve “deep equality” in Canada, members of the Toronto Ling Liang churches understood that they were also embracing what was in traditional Chinese and Sinophone civilizations – where No Religion, Confucianism, and the Three-Teachings of Confucianism-Buddhism-Daoism had always occupied the dominant position – a “minor religion.” Indeed, only 5 percent of the population in China identifies as Christian while, in Singapore, just over 20 percent of the population so identifies.⁶³ And yet, for Chinese people living in China, members of the Chinese diaspora around the world also constitute only a “minor people.” By the same token, for Canadians born in Canada, the Chinese and Sinophone immigrants are an ethnically “minor people” as well, and their denomination, the Ling Liang denomination, a “minor Christianity” within the families of either mainstream or Chinese/Sinophone Christianity. Choosing to embrace a “major religion” in a traditionally Christian country, however, was a powerful demonstration for those belonging to the Toronto Ling Liang churches of their desire to become fully integrated with Canadian culture and to assume a thoroughly mainstream identity. This leads to several conclusions.

First, this expression of the idea of the “will to religion” reflected “a broadly Foucauldian perspective on the care of the self and the requirement to confess” – in this instance to confess the Chinese or Sinophone Canadian’s belonging to a mainstream religious category.⁶⁴ The decision of these Chinese and Sinophone Canadians to embrace religiosity afforded

them tools for negotiating complex new identities connected to mainstream spiritual practice. Christianity had been a “major religion” in Canada but a “minor religion” in Chinese or Sinophone culture. The conversion of Chinese or Sinophone residents, immigrants, and Canadian citizens performed a “will to Christianity” thus moving their cultural identities from margin to center. The Toronto Spiritual Food Christians practiced a Christian-centered Canadian lifestyle, as the Foucauldian discursive construction of a “normal” in which all Canadians were religious, and through which values were construed as “universal,” and our moral and intellectual traditions firmly rooted in Christianity. This was perceived as a kind of “résumé whitewashing” for the spiritual lives of the “racial minority” and offered a means to combat discrimination in a postcolonial metropolitan capitalist city.

Second, the identity transformations that took place as members transitioned to a “majoritarian religion” at the Toronto Bread of Life churches were identifiable. Beaman points to four consequences in the religious shift to a “new normal” in which we are all religious, including the essentialization of religious identities, the overemphasis on religion, the infiltration of measures in religiosity, and the spread of religious freedom protectionism. Faced with this new normal, the shifting of the cultural location of Sinophone people from “minor” to “major religion” offered a means for indigenizing themselves as they also shifted from “minor” to “major cultural” actors. These new Chinese or Sinophone immigrants accepted Christianity because it afforded them a practical way to assume a new position in the majority culture by adopting the faith, symbols, and traditions all around them.⁶⁵

Conclusion

This article first reviewed the position of Chinese and Sinophone Christianity in Canada as the “major religion” of a “minor race.” It then provided a brief history of the Ling Liang Church as “an indigenous sect” of Christianity in China, as well as the denomination’s spread to Toronto under the “Matteo Ricci Rule.” In the third part, this article offered an examination of what it means to be a “Chinese- or Sinophone-Canadian Christian,” concluding that the hybrid “three-in-one identity” of the members of the Toronto Ling Liang churches performed a negotiation between cultural accommodation and spiritual practice. Historically, Christianity was “a foreign religion” and a “minor religion” among

Chinese people. The Chinese overseas diaspora has changed that in some contexts. Sinophone people in Toronto – “double marginalized” because they are marginalized by both the mainland Chinese and Canadian mainstream – chose to embrace the Spiritual Food Church, a sect of indigenous Chinese Christianity, in order to pursue a hybrid identity as a “Sinophone Canadian Christian,” seeking not merely accommodation, but also “deep equality.”

Those describing themselves as Ling Liang Sinophone-Canadian Christians have chosen to align themselves with Canada’s “major religion” while maintaining many Chinese cultural and spiritual practices. In their churches, they use English for the second or later generations and the Sinophone languages, including Mandarin and Chinese dialects such as Cantonese and Hakka, for the first or older generations. They celebrate Chinese, Canadian, and Christian festivals and practice these rites and cultures as one body. Their ethnic identity as Sinophone-Canadians is negotiated as a group by embracing both Chinese and Canadian religious and cultural norms. When conflict arises between these three identities, they seek remedy in their Christian faith and in the Bible. These Sinophone Christians, though they continue to practice Chinese rites and to celebrate Chinese festivals, owe no political loyalties to China or Taiwan. They follow Canadian laws, adopt Canadian social norms, and steadily improve their facility with English. By thus organizing and participating in these church activities, Ling Liang Christians acknowledge the hybrid nature of their cultural identities as Sinophone, Canadian, and Christian. The churches thus serve as an “umbrella community” and “cellular society” for “cultural converting” where Sinophone immigrants learn how best to live in the Greater Toronto Area while continuing to satisfy their spiritual needs as members of a marginalized minority group.

Endnotes

1. I would like to thank the four University of Toronto professors, Mark G. Toulouse and Phyllis D. Airhart, both in Emmanuel College of Victoria University, Li Chen in the Department of History, Vincent Shen in the Department of East Asian Studies, for their excellent guidance.
2. All Bible citations in this article are from *The New Oxford Annotated Bible with the Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books* (New Revised Standard Version), Augmented Third Edition, edited by Michael D. Coogan et al., (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007).

3. Brian Clarke and Stuart Macdonald, *Leaving Christianity: Changing Allegiances in Canada since 1945* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2017), 6.
4. The group of No Religion in 1961 was less than one percent, in 1971 was four percent, and in 2011 was near 25 percent. See these data respectively in Clarke and Macdonald, *Leaving Christianity*, 6, 25. These are not the percentages of those who were inactive in churches. Also, according to Mark A. Noll, "As late as 1961, only one-half of one percent of Canadian citizens told census takers that they were not attached to any religious body. That proportion rose to 4.3 percent in 1971 and in the latest census from 2001 . . . stands at 16.2 percent." See Noll, "What Happened to Christian Canada?" *Church History* 75, no. 2 (June 2006): 248.
5. In the Canadian Census 2011, the "Vast Majority" is, in fact, "White," while the category status of "Visible Minority" indicates those who self-identified "Chinese, South Asian, Black, Filipino, Latin American, Southeast Asian, Arab, West Asian, Japanese, Korean, Other-Specify," while the "Aboriginal Canadians" were lumped in with "All Others." Clarke and Macdonald, *Leaving Christianity*, 167.
6. Clarke and Macdonald, *Leaving Christianity*, 192.
7. Ling Liang World-Wide Evangelistic Mission Association: <http://www.llwwema.org>
8. Bread of Life Christian Church in Taipei: <https://www.breadoflife.taipei/en>, accessed 30 April 2018; BGAN (BOL Global Apostolic Network): <http://web.bolcc.tw/NPlanting/churches.php?page=1&type=A>
9. Xi Lian, *Redeemed by Fire: The Rise of Popular Christianity in Modern China* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010), 194.
10. Zhao Shiguang (Timothy Dzao), *Ershi nian huiyi: yi jiu er wu-yi jiu si wu (Twenty Years Memoir: 1925-1945)*, 2nd edition (Shanghai: Shanghai Ling Liang kan she, 1947), 2, 4.
11. Dzao, *Twenty Years Memoir*, 2.
12. Dzao, *Twenty Years Memoir*, 7.
13. Dzao, *Twenty Years Memoir*, 13.
14. Dzao, *Twenty Years Memoir*, 14, 18.
15. "You are the light of the world. A city built on a hill cannot be hidden" (Matthew 5:14).

16. Dzao, *Twenty Years Memoir*, 23, 41. The number of the church members increased from ten to more than 600. See *Arise, Shire: Bread of Life Christian Church in Taipei 60th Anniversary Celebration* (Taipei: 2014), 14.
17. Timothy S. K. Dzao, *Xuanjiao licheng [Progress of Evangelism]* (Hong Kong: Spiritual Food Publishers, 1969), 1:78, 1:82.
18. Robert Jaffray was born in 1873 into a wealthy Scottish immigrant family that owned Canada's *Toronto Globe* (now known as *The Globe and Mail*). He was the founder of the Wuzhou Bible School in Guangxi province, 1899, now the Alliance Bible Seminary in Hong Kong, and the editor and principal contributor of the Chinese language version *Bible Magazine*, published by South China Alliance Press. To meet the urgent need of serving overseas Chinese in South East Asia, Jaffray founded the first Chinese missionary society, called the Chinese Foreign Missionary Union (CFMU), in 1929 to send out missionaries to Indonesia, Thailand, and the Philippines. Jaffray served in Wuzhou for thirty-five years, in spite of a heart condition and diabetes. In 1942, Japan invaded Sulawesi Island in Indonesia where he was stationed with his wife, Minnie Donner, and his daughter. Soon after the invasion, Jaffray and other missionaries were arrested by the Japanese and sent to internment camps. Jaffray remained captive until his death in 1945 from illness and malnutrition. See Aiden Wilson Tozer, *Let My People Go: The Life of Robert A. Jaffray* (Harrisburg, PA: CrossReach Publications, 1947).
19. Dzao, *Progress of Evangelism*, 1:60, 1:108.
20. Dzao, *Progress of Evangelism*, 1:109. *Ling Liang Yuekan [Ling Liang Monthly]* 1, no. 1, Shanghai: Nanyang Budao Zhu Hu Weiyuanhui.
21. Dzao, *Progress of Evangelism*, 1:109. Up to the beginning of the Second World War in Asia, much of the church activities in China were still carried out by western missionaries; however, after the Japanese seized the International Settlement in Shanghai and controlled it in December 1941, identification with Western missions was no longer profitable.
22. Dzao, *Progress of Evangelism*, 1:110.
23. Lian, *Redeemed by Fire*, 194.
24. Dzao, *Progress of Evangelism*, 1:126-7.
25. Dzao, *Progress of Evangelism*, volume 1.
26. There were two Ling Liang churches in Calcutta, India. One was Ling Liang Chinese Church founded in 1963 by Rev. David Lamb, providing worship service in English and Haka (3.00 P.M.) at P-7 Hide Lane, Calcutta 700012,

West Bengal, India, in the Ling Liang High School (founded in 1963). The other was the Grace Ling Liang Church founded in 1973 also by Rev. David Lamb, providing worship service in English and Hakka (8.30 A.M.) at 21B Hughes Road, Calcutta 700046, West Bengal, India, in the Grace Ling Liang English School (founded in 1973). See “The Ling Liang Chinese Church Trust” from the Net Ministers network: <https://www.netministries.org/see/churches/ch17500>.

27. Fenggang Yang, *Chinese Christians in America: Conversion, Assimilation, and Adhesive Identities* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1999), 64-5, 77-8, 157, 201.
28. The other founders of the Ambassadors for Christ in the United States were the Choy couple, Ted and Leona Choy, with help from Christiana Tsai (*Cai Sujuan*, 1890-1984). The Ambassadors for Christ, Inc. was founded on 6 May 1963. See Cecelia, *Cong piaobo dao zhigeng: Beimei Huaren jiaohui fengcai lu* [*Been Adrift, Now Rooted: A Short History of North American Chinese Church*] (Petaluma, CA: CCM Publisher, Meiguo Zhongxin chubanshe, 2010), 183. Also see the Ambassadors for Christ, Inc.: <http://afcresources.org>
29. Xi Lian, *Redeemed by Fire*, 194.
30. Most new Chinese or Sinophone churches in North American were founded since the 1950s after the Chinese Exclusion Acts were replaced in 1943 in the United States and in 1947 in Canada.
31. *Jidujiao Ling Liang Shijie Budaohui Xianggang Qu Lianhe Chachuan Shigong Weiyuanhui* [Ling Liang World-Wide Evangelistic Mission Hong Kong United Mission]: <http://www.lingliangmission.org/about.html>, also including two in India, one in Australia, and three in Philippines.
32. In 1934, Timothy Dzao married Ms. Tang, a graduate of Shanghai Chinese Women’s Seminary and a great partner in his ministry. They gave birth to six daughters and one son. Sheng-Ping Guo’s interview with Ms. Gloria Dzao on 28 April 2018, in the Toronto Ling Liang Church, Markham, Ontario.
33. Sheng-Ping Guo’s interview with Ms. Gloria Dzao on 28 April 2018, Markham, Ontario. Also see *Duolunduo Ling Liang Tang* (Toronto Ling Liang Church): <http://tllchurch.wordpress.com>.
34. *Endian Ling Liang* [Grace Ling Liang Church]: <http://gracelingliangchurch.org>
35. Sheng-Ping Guo’s interview with Assistant Pastor Wei Hsien Chen (Michael Chen) on 28 April 2018, Markham, Ontario.
36. Bread of Life Christian Church in Taipei: <https://www.breadoflife.taipei/en>

37. BOL Global Apostolic Network: <http://web.bolcc.tw/NPlanting/index.php>, and the 611 Bread of Life Christian Church: <http://www.church611.org>. The 611 Bread of Life Christian Church in Hong Kong was established in 2001 by Rev. Ennian Zhang and developed more than seventy branch churches in fourteen countries as of 30 April 2018.
38. Fountain of Life Christian Church: <https://www.facebook.com/folcc.toronto>
39. River of Life Christian Church at Silicon Valley began its first Sunday worship in the classroom of the Santa Clara Mission College on 9 April 1995. It was established under the leadership of Rev. Tong Liu in Santa Clara, California, to fulfill a vision and mission from God to build a glorious church in the twenty-first century. This was a continuation of the vision and mission received by Rev. Timothy Dzao at the Bread of Life Christian Church in Shanghai and by Rev. Nathaniel Chow in Taipei. As of 31 December 2017, the number of member churches in the River of Life Christian Church at Silicon Valley has greatly increased and more than 190 daughter churches have been established in Mongolia (totalling forty-six daughter churches with the church in Ulaanbaatar being the biggest Protestant church in Mongolia with more than 1500 members), North America (forty churches in Canada and the United States), Africa (more than seventy churches in thirteen countries), and Central Asia (Uzbek, Kazakhstan, and Turkey). See River of Life Christian Church: <https://rolcc.net>
40. *Duolunduo Shengminghe Ling Liang Tang* [Toronto River of Life Christian Church]: <http://www.trolcc.ca>
41. Toronto River of Life Christian Church: <http://www.trolcc.ca>
42. River of Life Christian Church: <http://www.lrolcc.org>. Rev. Tong Liu received his bachelor's degree in Meteorology at the National University of Taiwan and his master's at the University of Maryland, United States. After graduation he joined the United States Weather Bureau, while serving at the Ambassadors for Christ in Pennsylvania. In 1983 he received his calling to serve God full time and started his theological studies at the Westminster Theological Seminary, Philadelphia. After graduation, he joined San Jose Christian Alliance Church and served as an assistant Pastor for the Mandarin congregation for about ten years. Under his leadership, the River of Life Christian Church focused on a vision with four main tracks – Worship and Praise, Renewal of the Holy Spirit, Cell Church, and World Missions. Rev. Liu was an outstanding worship leader for his captivating and powerful sermons. His wife Belinda founded the Double Portion Media to minister sister groups (see <https://rolcc.net>).
43. River of Life Christian Church: <http://www.lrolcc.org>

44. David B. Barrett, et al., "Christian World Communions: Five Overviews of Global Christianity, AD 1800-2025," *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 33, no. 1 (January 2009): 32.
45. These figures did not include many family groups or Bible study classes that had pastoral members and functioned as churches. See Morley Lee, "Ershiyi shiji haiwai Huaren Fuyin shigong jianjie" [Introduction to the 21st Century's Overseas Chinese World Evangelism], CCCOWE: http://www.cccowe.org/content.php?id=others_mschurches_lausanne2010report.
46. Lee, "Introduction to the 21st Century's Overseas Chinese World Evangelism."
47. The Chinese Coordination Centre of World Evangelism (CCCOWE): <http://www.cccowe.org>. There were 14.404 billion Chinese in mainland China in 2010 ("Communiqué of the National Bureau of Statistics of People's Republic of China on Major Figures of the 2010 Population Census (No. 1)," National Bureau of Statistics of China: <http://www.stats.gov.cn>). There were about 31.64 million Chinese or Sinophone peoples in the Greater China area beyond mainland China: 23.57 million Chinese in Taiwan in April 2018 (National Statistics, Republic of China (Taiwan), "Statistics from Statistical Bureau": <https://eng.stat.gov.tw>), 7.41 million in Hong Kong in December 2017 (The Census and Statistics Department, Government of Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, "Hong Kong Monthly Digest of Statistics (Report)": <https://www.censtatd.gov.hk>), and 0.66 million in Macau in March 2018 (DSEC, Statistics and Census Service, Government of Macao Special Administrative Region: <http://www.dsec.gov.mo>). The Chinese diasporas or Sinophone peoples: there were 7.57 million overseas Chinese (Hawaii Huaren/Weiji Huaren) in Indonesia, 7.15 million in Thailand, 7.07 million in Malaysia, 3.50 million in the United States, 3.38 million in Singapore (majority), 1.77 million in Canada (Statistics Canada, "Immigration and Ethnocultural Diversity Highlight Tables": <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/eng>, accessed 1 May 2018), 1.30 million in Peru, 1.26 million in Vietnam, 1.15 million in Philippine, 1.10 million in Myanmar, 1.00 million in Russia, 0.67 million in Australia, 0.52 million in Japan, 0.35 million in United Kingdom, 0.34 million in Cambodia, 0.23 million in France, 0.19 million in India, 0.19 million in Laos, 0.15 million in Brazil, 0.15 million in New Zealand, 0.14 million in Italy, 0.14 million in Netherlands, 0.14 million in South Korea, and 0.10 million in South Africa (Except where mentioned in brackets, all data are from "Overseas Chinese," *New World Encyclopedia*: <http://www.newworldencyclopedia.org>).
48. "2004 nian Xianggang jiaohui xiankuang baogao" [2004 Status Report on Hong Kong Churches], CCCOWE: http://www.cccowe.org/churchreport/topic_body85.html

49. Lee, "Introduction to the 21st Overseas Chinese World Evangelism."
50. As of 1 May 2018, among the 9,000 churches, single mega-churches with more than 2,000-5,000 registered churchgoers included the following several churches: Evangelical Free Church of China-Yan Fook Church (EFCC Yan Fook Church, Hong Kong), Kowloon City Baptist Church (Hong Kong), Shatin Baptist Church (Hong Kong), North Point Alliance Church (Hong Kong), Wing Kwong Pentecostal Holiness Church (Hong Kong), Bread of Life Christian Church in Taipei (Taiwan), River of Life Christian Church (Santa Clara, Greater San Francisco Area), and Richmond Hill Christian Community Church (RHCCC, Greater Toronto Area).
51. Here the Chinese church was defined as located in Hong Kong, Taiwan, Macau, and the Chinese diasporic and Sinophone church was defined as located at all other overseas places, not including mainland China.
52. Sheng-Ping Guo's observations in church services and interviews with the pastors of these churches, from February to May 2018, in the Greater Toronto Area, Canada.
53. Shu-mei Shih, *Visuality and Identity: Sinophone Articulations across the Pacific* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007), 4.
54. Shu-mei Shih, "The Concept of Sinophone," *PMLA* 126, no. 3 (May 2011): 710-11.
55. Tu Wei-ming, "Cultural China: The Periphery as the Center," *Daedalus* 120, no. 2 (The Living Tree: The Changing Meaning of Being Chinese Today, Spring 1991): 1-32. See <https://www.jstor.org/stable/20025372>
56. Wang Gungwu, *A Short History of the Nanyang Chinese* (Singapore: D. Moore for Eastern Universities Press, 1959).
57. Leo Ou-fan Lee, "On the Margins of the Chinese Discourse: Some Personal Thoughts on the Cultural Meaning of the Periphery," *Daedalus* 120, no. 2 (The Living Tree: The Changing Meaning of Being Chinese Today, Spring 1991): 207-26. Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20025380>.
58. Nanyang was a Sinocentric Chinese term for the warmer and fertile geographical region south of China, otherwise known as the Southeast and South Asia near the Chinese South Sea. The term came into common usage in self-reference to the large ethnic Chinese migrant population in Southeast Asia and was contrasted with Xiyang (literally "Western Ocean"), which referred to the Western world, and Dongyang (literally "Eastern Ocean"), which referred to Japan. The Chinese press regularly used the term to refer to the region stretching from the Yunnan province to Singapore in the south and from India

to Vietnam in the west and east of China; the term also referred to Brunei, Malaysia (eastern part), Indonesia, and the Philippines in the region it encompassed. See Bertil Lintner, "Enter the Dragon," *Far Eastern Economic Review* (22 December 1994), 23. The Nanyang was extremely important in the trade for business and was one of China's main trading partners in early years. Nanyang encompassed three main trading routes: one through Burma, one through Vietnam, and one through Laos. See Bertil Lintner, *Blood Brothers: Crime, Business and Politics in Asia* (Crows Nest, NSW: Allen & Unwin, 2002), 221. Shu-mei Shih, "Introduction: What Is Sinophone Studies?" in *Sinophone Studies: A Critical Reader*, ed. Shu-mei Shih, Chien-hsin Tsai, and Brian Bernards (New York: Columbia University Press, 2013), 1-16. David Chuenyan Lai and Jack Leung, "Toronto Chinatown 1878-2012," 1 in the Canada Chinatown Series edited by Chinese Canadian History Project Council, published by David See-Chai Lam Centre for International Communication, Simon Fraser University, 2012. According to Lai and Leung, after the Canadian Pacific Railway was completed in 1885, a steady stream of Chinese immigrants came to Toronto by rail from Vancouver. By 1900, 200 Chinese residents and ninety-five Chinese businesses formed the origin of the Toronto downtown Chinatown. Shu-mei Shih, "Introduction: What Is Sinophone Studies?" in *Sinophone Studies: A Critical Reader*, ed. Shu-mei Shih, Chien-hsin Tsai, and Brian Bernards (New York: Columbia University Press, 2013), 1-16.

59. Historica Canada, "Chinese Canadians," www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca
60. Beaman Lori, *Deep Equality in an Era of Diversity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017), 56-89.
61. Lori, *Deep Equality in an Era of Diversity*, 122-54.
62. The concept of "major religion" was inspired by the concept of a "minor literature" in Gilles Deleuze, Félix Guattari, and Robert Brinkley, "What Is a Minor Literature?" *Mississippi Review* 11, No. 3 (Winter/Spring 1983): 13-33. Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20133921>.
63. The estimated 2010 Christian population in the People's Republic of China was 67,070,000 and the percentage of population that was Christian was 5.0, which occupied 3.1 percent of the world Christian population (of 2,184,060,000 that was 31.7 percent of the 2010 global population of 6.9 billion). Pew Research Center's Forum on Religion & Public Life Global Christianity: <http://www.pewforum.org/category/publications/2011/>, "Global Christianity: A Report on the Size and Distribution of the World's Christian Population" (published on 19 December 2011), 60, 75, 97 accessed 1 May 2018. From the same source on page 75-6, the data of Hong Kong: 840,000, 11.9 percent, < 0.1; Macau: 40,000, 7.2 percent, < 0.1; Taiwan: 1,290,000, 5.5

percent, < 0.1; Singapore: 920,000, 18.2 percent, < 0.1. Singapore Department of Statistics, "Census of Population 2014 Statistical Release 1 - Demographic Characteristics, Education, Language and Religion" (PDF), archived from the original 2011 census: <http://www.singstat.gov.sg/pubn/popn/C2010sr1/cop2010sr1.pdf>.

64. Lori G. Beaman, "The Will to Religion: Obligatory Religious Citizenship," *Critical Research on Religion* 1, Issue 2 (2013): 141.
65. Lori G. Beaman, "Battles over Symbols: The "Religion" of the Minority Versus the "Culture" of the Majority," *Journal of Law and Religion* 28, 1 (2013): 101-138. According to Beaman, symbols are never just about symbols, but also about power and the upholding of class, gender, race, and sexuality relations. The core argument of her article is that the cultural transformation of religious symbols allows for the preservation of a majority religious hegemony in the name of culture. Moreover, the move to culture opens space for an argument that religious values are universal values.